

# State of California

# **NEW MOTOR VEHICLE BOARD**

# Guide to the New Motor Vehicle Board

February 2025

# **STATE OF CALIFORNIA**

# **NEW MOTOR VEHICLE BOARD**

2415 1<sup>st</sup> Avenue, MS L242 Sacramento, California 95818 Phone: (916) 445-1888 Email: <u>nmvb@nmvb.ca.gov</u> Website: <u>http://www.nmvb.ca.gov</u>

State of California GAVIN NEWSOM, GOVERNOR

California State Transportation Agency

TOKS OMISHAKIN, SECRETARY

#### **BOARD MEMBERS**

**Public Members** 

KATHRYN ELLEN DOI ARDASHES (ARDY) KASSAKHIAN BISMARCK OBANDO JACOB STEVENS

> Dealer Members ANNE SMITH BOLAND ASHLEY DENA BRADY SCHMIDT

#### **EXECUTIVE STAFF**

TIMOTHY M. CORCORAN Executive Director KIMBERLEE VAYE Assistant Director and Equity Officer

#### **LEGAL STAFF**

ROBIN P. PARKER Chief Counsel

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREAMBLE	i
PREFACE	ii
INTRODUCTION	1
Purpose	
Organization	1
Meetings	2
Jurisdiction	2
NEW AS OF 2025	4
Legislation	4
Case Law	4
Regulations	4
POWERS AND DUTIES IN GENERAL	5
Enforcement of Board Orders	5
Mandatory Settlement Conferences	5
DISPUTES BETWEEN THE DEALER AND THE FRANCHISOR	6
PROTESTS IN GENERAL	8
Statutory Authority	8
Statutory Bases for Protest	8
Separate Protests	9
Filing Protest	9
Franchisor's Notice of Appearance	10
Filing Fee	10
Interested Individuals	10
Motion for Intervention	10
Challenge to Presiding Officer	10
Amicus Curiae Briefs	
Table of Contents for Protest Section	12
TERMINATION OF FRANCHISE	13
Statutory Authority for Protest	
Franchisor's Notice of Termination	13
Time for Filing a Protest	14
Required Elements of Protest	16
Good Cause	17
Determination of Protest	
MODIFICATION OF FRANCHISE	18
Statutory Authority for Protest	18
Franchisor's Notice of Modification	
Time for Filing a Protest	
Required Elements of Protest	20
Good Cause	20
Determination of Protest	21
ADDITIONAL OR RELOCATED FRANCHISE	22
Statutory Authority for Protest	
Franchisor's Notice of Additional or Relocated Franchise	22

# TABLE OF CONTENTS -continued-

Exceptions to the Right to Protest	23
New Motor Vehicle Dealers (including RVs)	
Recreational Vehicle Dealers Only	
Time for Filing a Protest	
Required Elements of Protest	
Good Cause	
Determination of Protest	26
ADDITIONAL OR RELOCATED SATELLITE WARRANTY FACILITY	27
Statutory Authority for Protest	27
Franchisor's Notice of Additional or Relocated Satellite Warranty Facility	
Time for Filing a Protest	27
Required Elements of Protest	29
Good Cause	
Determination of Protest	
COMPENSATION FOR DELIVERY AND PREPARATION	
Statutory Authority	
Franchisor's Notice of Compensation for Delivery and Preparation	
Time for Filing a Protest	
Required Elements of Protest	32
Determination of Protest	
WARRANTY CLAIMS - Motor Vehicle Dealers	
Franchisor's Notice of Compensation for Warranty Reimbursement	
Reasonableness of the Warranty Reimbursement Schedule	33
Protest of Pre-Repair Challenges to the Reduction in Time and Compensation	
(Labor Time Guides) Applicable to Specific Parts or Labor Operations	
Approval of Warranty Claims	
Disapproval of Warranty Claims for a Defective Part	
Disapproval of Warranty Claims	
Protest of Initial Disapproval of Warranty Claims	
Franchisor Provided "Reasonable" Appeal Process	
Final Denial of Warranty Claim	
Protest of Final Denial of Warranty Claim Following a Franchisor's Appeal Process	
Audits of Franchisee Warranty Records	35
Disapproval of Previously Approved Warranty Claims	36
Protest of Warranty Claim Disapproval of a Previously Approved Claim Following	20
an Audit	
Franchisor Provided "Reasonable" Appeal Process	
Final Denial of Warranty Claim Following an Audit	
Protest of Final Denial of Warranty Claim following an Audit Following the	27
Franchisor's Appeal Process	
Franchisor Chargeback for Warranty Claims	
Required Elements of a Protest	
Warranty Claims Protests Chart	39

RETAIL LABOR RATE OR RETAIL PARTS RATE - Motor Vehicle Dealers	40
Establishment or Modification of a Franchisee's Retail Labor Rate or Retail Par	ts
Rate	40
How a Franchisee Calculates its Retail Labor Rate?	40
How a Franchisee Calculates its Retail Parts Rate?	
Statutorily Required Notice to the Franchisor by the Franchisee of its Retail Lab	or
Rate and Retail Parts Rate	40
How Repair Orders are Submitted Pursuant to Section 3065.2	40
What Types of Charges Included in a Repair Order Should be Omitted in	
Calculating a Franchisee's Retail labor Rate and Retail Parts Rate	41
A Franchisor may Contest to the Franchisee the "Material Accuracy" of the Ret	ail
Labor Rate or Retail Labor Parts Rate by Submitting a "Notification" to the	
	42
The Franchisor's Proposed Adjusted Retail Labor Rate or Retail Parts Rate is	
Effective if the Franchisee Agrees	
If the Franchisee does not Agree with the Proposed Adjusted Rate then a Prote	
can be Filed with the Board	43
If the Franchisor Determines that the Franchisee's Retail Labor Rate or Retail	
Parts Rate is "Substantially Higher" than the Franchisee's Current Warranty F	
the Franchisor can Request Supplemental Repair Orders	
What if the Franchisor does not Contest the Retail Labor Rate or Retail Parts R	
Considerations in Calculating the Retail Labor Rate and Retail Parts Rate	44
Considerations when the Franchisor is Compensating the Franchisee for the	
Retail Parts Rate	44
The Method of Establishing or Modifying a Franchisee's Retail Labor Rate,	15
Retail Parts Rate, or Both	
What Actions Franchisors are Precluded from Undertaking Protest for Franchisor's Failure to Comply with Section 3065.2 or if Franchisee	40
Disputes the Franchisor's Proposed Adjusted Retail Labor Rate or Retail	
Parts Rate	16
Time for Filing a Protest	
Required Elements of Protest	
Determination of Protest	
Retail Labor Rate or Retail Parts Rate Protests Chart	
WARRANTY CLAIMS - RV Dealers	
Statutory Authority	
Franchisor's Notice of Compensation for Warranty Reimbursement	
Approval of Warranty Claims	
Disapproval of Warranty Claims	
Audits of Franchisee Warranty Records	
Time for Filing a Protest	
Required Elements of a Protest	
Good Cause	
Determination of Protest	
FRANCHISOR INCENTIVE PROGRAM CLAIMS - Motor Vehicle Dealers	53
Statutory Authority	
Franchisor's Notice of Denial of Franchisor Incentive Program Reimbursement	53

# TABLE OF CONTENTS -continued-

Approval/Disapproval of Franchisor Incentive Program Reimbursement	53
Disapproval of Franchisor Incentive Program Claims	
Protest of Initial Disapproval of Franchisor Incentive Program Claims	
Franchisor Provided "Reasonable" Appeal Process	
Final Denial of Franchisor Incentive Program Claim	
Protest of Final Denial of Franchisor Incentive Program Claim Following a	-
Franchisor's Appeal Process	54
Audits of Franchisee Incentive Program Records	
Disapproval of Previously Approved Franchisor Incentive Program Claims	
Protest of Franchisor Incentive Program Claim Disapproval of a Previously	
Approved Claim Following an Audit	55
Franchisor Provided "Reasonable" Appeal Process	
Final Denial of Franchisor Incentive Program Claim Following an Audit	
Protest of Final Denial of Franchisor Incentive Program Claim Following an	
Audit Following the Franchisor's Appeal Process	56
Franchisor Chargeback for Incentive Program Claims	56
Required Elements of Protest	
Franchisor Incentive Program Protests Chart	
FRANCHISOR INCENTIVE PROGRAM CLAIMS - RV Dealers	59
Statutory Authority	
Franchisor's Notice of Denial of Franchisor Incentive Program Reimbursement	59
Approval/Disapproval of Franchisor Incentive Program Reimbursement	59
Audits of Franchisee Incentive Program Records	59
Time for Filing a Protest	59
Required Elements of Protest	60
Good Cause	60
Determination of Protest	60
LIMITATIONS ON CERTAIN FRANCHISOR ACTIONS INCONSISTENT WITH	
EXISTING STANDARDS - Motor Vehicle Dealers	61
a. Franchisor Performance Standards, Sales Objectives, or Programs for	
Measuring a Dealer's Sales, Service, or Customer Service Performance	
(Veh. Code § 3065.3(a))	
b. Franchisor Allocation of Vehicles or Parts(Veh. Code § 3065.3(b))	61
<ul> <li>c. Franchisor's Imposition of a Facility or Equipment Policy</li> </ul>	
(Veh. Code § 3065.3(c))	
Time for Filing a Protest	
Required Elements of Protest	
Determination of Protest	64

FRANCHISOR COMPETING WITH A DEALER - Motor Vehicle Dealers	
Time for Filing a Protest	
Required Elements of Protest	
Determination of Protest	
HEARING PROCEDURES	67
Pre-Hearing Procedure	67
Discovery	67
Subpoenas	
Summary of Board Action	68
Stipulation of Fact	
Stipulated Decisions	
Hearings Open to the Public; Protective Orders	70
Failure to Appear at a Hearing	70
Decision of the Board	
Court Reporting and Transcripts of Board Proceedings	71
PETITIONS	
Statutory Authority for Petitions	72
Filing a Petition with the Board	72
Time for Filing a Petition	73
Petition Filing Fee	73
Required Elements of Petition	74
First Consideration	75
Resolution of Petitions without a Hearing	75
Challenge to Presiding Officer	75
Motion for Intervention	75
Amicus Curiae Briefs	76
Summary of Board Action	76
Hearing Procedures	76
Informal Mediation	
Members of the Public in Relation to New Recreational Vehicle Transactions	77
JUDICIAL REVIEW	78
Appeal to Superior Court	78
APPENDIX	
Sample Form A - Pleading Format of Protest	
Sample Form B1 - Pleading Format of Petition (Veh. Code § 3050(b)(2))	
Sample Form B2 - Pleading Format of Petition (Veh. Code § 3050(b)(1) or (3))	A-6

# PREAMBLE

This publication provides general information only as to the most pertinent Vehicle Code sections as they relate to practice before the New Motor Vehicle Board ("Board"). There are many other important Vehicle Code sections and Department of Motor Vehicles ("Department") regulations not covered in this publication. The materials contained herein are intended to be informative and not advisory, limited in scope, and are not intended to be a substitute for careful reading of the specific statutes and regulations that may apply to your particular situation. Practitioners as well as the general public are invited to comment on the forms and contents of procedures. The Board only has one office in Sacramento. All correspondence, protests, and petitions should be sent to:

New Motor Vehicle Board ATTN: Legal Department 2415 1<sup>st</sup> Avenue, MS L242 Sacramento, California 95818

Correspondence can also be sent via email at <u>nmvb@nmvb.ca.gov</u>. The telephone number of the Board is (916) 445-1888 and the website address is <u>www.nmvb.ca.gov</u>. Detailed information can be found on the Board's website. Please feel free to contact the Board's staff for further information.

#### PREFACE

The purpose of this publication is to familiarize the reader with the organization and jurisdiction of the Board, including the Board's operations and procedures. All statutory references are to pertinent sections of the Vehicle Code unless otherwise specified. The full text of pertinent sections of the Vehicle Code is available at <a href="http://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/codes.xhtml">http://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/codes.xhtml</a> or on the Board's website. References to regulations are to Title 13 of the California Code of Regulations ("CCR").<sup>1</sup> The referenced sections will be noted in the following manner, for example, 13 CCR § 550, et seq. The regulations are also available on the Board's website or at the Office of Administrative Law's ("OAL") website (<a href="http://www.oal.ca.gov">www.oal.ca.gov</a>). Once you reach the OAL site, select California Code of Regulations. You will be taken to the California Code of Regulations and can search by title; the Board's regulations are in Title 13. As the Board is a quasi-judicial agency that holds administrative hearings, statutes comprising the administrative adjudication provisions of the Administrative Procedure Act ("APA"; Gov. Code §§ 11400 through 11529) are applicable. Citations to relevant court decisions are interspersed throughout. The provisions of the APA are available at <a href="http://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/codes.xhtml">http://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/codes.xhtml</a>.

The Board also publishes the *Informational Guide for Manufacturers and Distributors* to assist manufacturers and distributors in clarifying California's vehicle franchise laws. It is designed for personnel in manufacturer or distributor market representation departments, dealer development departments, or legal departments. The *Informational Guide for Manufacturers and Distributors* is available free from the Board's offices at the above address, or can be accessed and downloaded from the Board's website at <u>www.nmvb.ca.gov</u>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The Board's regulations, Sections 550 through 598, are under Title 13 (Motor Vehicles), Division 1 (Department of Motor Vehicles), Chapter 2 (New Motor Vehicle Board) of the California Code of Regulations. There are separate and different regulation provisions for petitions (Articles 2 and 4) and protests (Article 5).

# **INTRODUCTION**

# <u>Purpose</u>

The Board is a program within the Department. The Board was originally created in 1967 as the New Car Dealers Policy and Appeals Board. At that time, the Board's only function was hearing appeals<sup>1</sup> from final decisions of the Director of the Department adverse to the occupational license of a new motor vehicle dealer, manufacturer, distributor, or representative.<sup>2</sup> In 1973, the Legislature passed the California Automobile Franchise Act (Stats. 1973, Ch. 966, § 1, p. 2), which gave the Board its present name and created a broad statutory framework and a forum for regulating and settling disputes in the new vehicle industry. The constitutionality of this regulatory scheme has survived a due process challenge in the United States Supreme Court (*New Motor Vehicle Board* v. *Orrin W. Fox Co.* (1978) 439 U.S. 96).

# **Organization**

The organization of the Board is prescribed in Vehicle Code sections 3000 to 3016. The Board is comprised of nine members. The chart below identifies the composition of the Board.

Who	Qualifications	Appointment
Four licensed new motor vehicle dealers. (Dealers that deal exclusively in motorcycles, ATVs, or recreational vehicles are excluded from membership on the Board.)	Must have been licensed as a new motor vehicle dealer for not less than five years.	All by the Governor.
Five members from the general public.	One must be an attorney who has been a member of the California Bar for at least 10 years.	Three by the Governor. One by the Senate Rules Committee. One by the Speaker of the Assembly.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Effective January 1, 2020, the Board's jurisdiction to hear appeals was repealed. (Assembly Bill 179, Ch. 796)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Throughout this Guide, the terms dealer, protestant, and franchisee are used interchangeably, as are the terms manufacturer/distributor, respondent, and franchisor.

# **Meetings**

The Board meets at least twice during each calendar year, with supplemental meetings held as necessary. Board meetings are open to the public with the exception of executive sessions, which are held to deliberate on pending matters before the Board. As public meetings conducted by a state entity, the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act (Gov. Code §§ 11120 through 11132) covers all requirements for public notice, agendas, public testimony and the conduct of Board meetings. To the extent practicable, the Board conducts business at meetings using procedures set forth in *Robert's Rules of Order*.

# **Jurisdiction**

The Board's statutory jurisdiction under Vehicle Code section 3050(b) extends over any person applying for or holding a license as a new motor vehicle dealer, manufacturer, manufacturer branch, distributor, distributor branch, or representative. In the past, the courts construed this jurisdiction as primary and exclusive, meaning an aggrieved licensee must bring any dispute arising out of the franchise relationship before the Board prior to seeking judicial relief (Yamaha Motor Company v. Superior Court (1986) 185 Cal.App.3d 1232; Yamaha Motor Company v. Superior Court (1987) 195 Cal.App.3d 652; Ray Fladeboe Lincoln-Mercury, Inc. v. New Motor Vehicle Board (1992) 10 Cal.App.4<sup>th</sup> 51; Mathew Zaheri Corp. v. Mitsubishi Motor Sales of America, Inc. (1993) 17 Cal.App.4<sup>th</sup> 288.) However, subsequent court decisions have held otherwise (Miller v. Superior Court (1996) 50 Cal.App.4th 1665; Hardin Oldsmobile v. New Motor Vehicle Board (1997) 52 Cal.App.4<sup>th</sup> 585; Tovas v. American Honda Motor Company, Inc. (1997) 57 Cal.App.4th 506; Kemp v. Nissan Motor Corporation in U.S.A. (1997) 57 Cal.App.4th 1527.) As a consequence of these judicial decisions, subdivision (e) of Vehicle Code section 3050 was added by the Legislature in 1997 and became effective in 1998. It provides that the courts have jurisdiction over all common law and statutory claims originally cognizable in the courts. For those claims, a party may initiate an action directly in any court of competent jurisdiction.

In 2003, the Board's petition jurisdiction was further narrowed by the Third District Court of Appeal in Mazda Motor of America, Inc. v. California New Motor Vehicle Board; David J. Phillips Buick-Pontiac, Inc., Real Party in Interest (2003) 110 Cal.App.4th 1451. The court held that the Board's jurisdiction for licensee versus licensee petitions is limited to those in which the petitioner seeks relief under Vehicle Code section 3050, subdivision (c)(1) or (3) [Effective January 1, 2020, this relief is now in subdivision (b)(1) and (b)(3)]. Subdivision (c)(1) allows the Board to direct the Department to conduct an investigation of matters that the Board deems reasonable. Subdivision (c)(3) permits the Board to order the Department to "exercise any and all authority or power that the department may have with respect to the issuance, renewal, refusal to renew, suspension, or revocation" of the occupational license of a manufacturer or distributor. The Board's jurisdiction under Vehicle Code section 3050, subdivision (c)(2) [Effective January 1, 2020, this relief is now in subdivision (b)(2)], which provides that the Board may "undertake to mediate, arbitrate, or otherwise resolve any honest difference of opinion or viewpoint [i.e., hold a hearing] existing between any member of the public and any new motor vehicle dealer, manufacturer, ... distributor ...", is now limited to petitions brought by members of the public, and does not include licensees as petitioners.

Effective January 1, 2004, the Vehicle Code was amended to bring new recreational vehicles ("RVs") as defined in Health and Safety Code section 18010(a) under the jurisdiction of the Board for purposes of dispute resolution and fee collection (Senate Bill 248, Stats. 2003, Ch. 703 § 11). This Guide integrates current Board processes and procedures to the extent they can be used to resolve disputes in the RV segment of the new motor vehicle industry and sets forth unique procedures that pertain to RV issues exclusively.

Effective January 1, 2020, the Board's jurisdiction over appeals was repealed.

# NEW AS OF 2025

# **Legislation**

There were no legislative changes impacting the Board's jurisdiction.

# Case Law

There were no new opinions impacting the Board's jurisdiction that were final in 2024.

# **Regulations**

There were no new or amended regulations that impact the Board's jurisdiction.

# POWERS AND DUTIES IN GENERAL

The powers and duties of the Board are set out in Vehicle Code sections 3050 and 3051. New motor vehicle dealers, manufacturers, and distributors under the jurisdiction of the Board are charged fees to fund the Board's activities. (Veh. Code § 3016; 13 CCR § 553) In addition to delegating rulemaking authority to the Board, Vehicle Code section 3050 empowers the Board to resolve disputes arising in the form of protest or petitions.

As a quasi-judicial body, the Board has authority under Vehicle Code section 3050.1(a) to:

- Administer oaths;
- Take depositions;
- Certify to official acts; and,
- Issue subpoenas to compel attendance of witnesses and the production of documents.

# Enforcement of Board Orders

There are provisions for sanctions and penalties for violating orders of the Board or the requirements of those sections of the Vehicle Code within the Board's authority. Obedience to subpoenas and the compliance with discovery procedures can be enforced by application to the Superior Courts. (Veh. Code § 3050.2(a)) Vehicle Code section 3050.2(b) gives the Executive Director authority, at the direction of the Board, upon a showing of failure to comply with authorized discovery without substantial justification, to dismiss a protest or petition or suspend the proceedings pending compliance. Vehicle Code section 11726 provides for enforcement of Board orders by permitting any licensee to recover damages, attorney fees, and injunctive relief in any court of competent jurisdiction for a willful failure to comply with a Board order.

#### Mandatory Settlement Conferences

In any protest or petition filed with the Board, the Board, its Executive Director, or an Administrative Law Judge ("ALJ") may order a mandatory settlement conference. (Veh. Code § 3050.4) For any proceeding, the settlement conference judge is precluded from hearing the proceeding on the merits or other motions in the case without stipulation by the parties. (13 CCR § 551.11) The failure of a party to appear, to be prepared, or to have the authority to settle the matter at such a conference may result in the Board taking action adverse to that party. (Veh. Code § 3050.4)

# **DISPUTES BETWEEN THE DEALER AND THE FRANCHISOR**

The Vehicle Code gives the Board jurisdiction to resolve disputes involving the following:

Type of Case	Vehicle Code Authority	Page Nos.
Attempts by the franchisor to terminate, modify, or refuse to continue (renew) the franchise.	3060, 3070	13-21
Attempts by the franchisor to establish a new, or relocate an existing, dealer (of the "same line-make") if the current franchisee is within a radius of 10 air miles of the proposed location (called the "relevant market area").	3062(a)(1), 3072(a)(1)	22-26
Attempts by the franchisor to establish a satellite warranty facility at, or relocate an existing satellite warranty facility to, a location that is within 2 miles of any dealership of the same line-make. ( <u>Note:</u> there are no comparable provisions for RV dealers.)	3062(a)(2)	27-30
Disputes relating to the dealers' delivery and preparation obligations, and compensation for such services.	3064, 3074	31-32
Disputes relating to reimbursement for warranty work performed by motor vehicle dealers.	3065	33-39
Disputes relating to a franchisee's retail labor rate or retail parts rate. ( <u>Note:</u> there are no comparable provisions for RV dealers.)	3065.4	40-49
Disputes relating to reimbursement for warranty work performed by RV dealers.	3075	50-52
Disputes relating to reimbursement for franchisor incentive programs by motor vehicle dealers.	3065.1	53-58
Disputes relating to reimbursement for franchisor incentive programs by RV dealers.	3076	59-60
Disputes relating to a franchisor's performance standard, sales objective, or program for measuring a dealer's sales, service, or customer service performance. ( <u>Note:</u> there are no comparable provisions for RV dealers.)	3065.3(a)	61-64
Disputes relating to a franchisor's allocation of vehicles or parts. ( <u>Note:</u> there are no comparable provisions for RV dealers.)	3065.3(b)	61-64
Disputes relating to a franchisor's imposition of a facility or equipment policy. ( <u>Note:</u> there are no comparable provisions for RV dealers.)	3065.3(c)	61-64
Disputes relating to a franchisor competing with a dealer. ( <u>Note:</u> there are no comparable provisions for RV dealers.)	3065.3(d)	65-66

Type of Case	Vehicle Code Authority	Page Nos.
All other disputes concerning the activities or practices of any person applying for or holding a license as a new motor vehicle dealer, manufacturer, or distributor submitted by any member of the public <sup>3</sup> or disputes between a franchisor and a franchisee seeking an investigation or a licensing action by the Department.	3050(b)	72-77

**NOTE:** Vehicle Code section 3050(c) prohibits a dealer member from participating, hearing, commenting, advising other members upon, or deciding any matter that involves a protest filed "pursuant to Article 4 (commencing with Section 3060), unless all parties to the protest stipulate otherwise."

Vehicle Code section 3066(f) states: "[a] member of the board who is a new motor vehicle dealer may not participate in, hear, comment, or advise other members upon, or decide, a matter involving a protest filed pursuant to this article [Article 4, i.e., protests involving motor vehicles other than RVs] unless all parties to the protest stipulate otherwise." These constraints ensure procedures that preclude any suggestion of bias or partiality of Board decisions.

The dealer members may participate in those matters not involving a dispute between a franchisee and franchisor such as a petition filed by a member of the public. For matters before the Board in which relief is sought pursuant to Vehicle Code section 3050(b), dealer members may not participate and there are no provisions to allow parties to stipulate and permit participation.

In Article 4 protests (involving cars, motorcycles, and ATVs), dealer members may participate if both parties so stipulate. Dealer members participate in Article 5 recreational vehicle protests unless the dealer Board member also owns and/or has a financial interest in a recreational vehicle dealership. Both parties can stipulate to allow the dealer member to participate in this instance.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Members of the public have the option to seek informal mediation of their disputes (13 CCR § 551.14, et seq.) as well as administrative hearings on the merits pursuant to the Board's petition process.

# **PROTESTS IN GENERAL**

# **Statutory Authority**

Vehicle Code section 3050(c) provides for the Board to hear and decide any protest presented by a franchisee against a franchisor.

# **Statutory Bases for Protest**

A protest can arise as a result of disputes contemplated by the following statutory provisions:

Vehicle Code Section	Provision
3060, 3070	The franchisor attempts to terminate, modify, or refuses to continue the franchise.
3062(a)(1), 3072(a)(1)	The franchisor attempts to establish an additional dealer or relocate an existing dealer within the relevant market area (any area within a radius of 10 miles from the site of a potential new dealership) where the same line-make is already represented.
3062(a)(2)	The franchisor attempts to establish an additional satellite warranty facility or relocate an existing satellite warranty facility within 2 miles of any dealership of the same line-make. ( <u>Note:</u> there are no comparable provisions for RV dealers.)
3064, 3074	Disputes relating to the dealer's delivery and preparation obligations, and compensation for such services.
3065, 3075	Disputes relating to reimbursement for warranty work performed by the dealer.
3065.4	Disputes relating to a franchisee's retail labor rate or retail parts rate or its franchisor's proposed adjusted retail labor rate or retail parts rate. ( <u>Note:</u> there are no comparable provisions for RV dealers.)
3065.1, 3076	Disputes relating to reimbursement for franchisor incentive programs.
3065.3(a)	Disputes relating to whether a franchisor's performance standard, sales objective or program for measuring a dealer's sales, service, or customer service performance is inconsistent with the standards set forth in subdivision (g) of Section 11713.13. ( <u>Note:</u> there are no comparable provisions for RV dealers.)
3065.3(b)	Disputes relating to whether a franchisor's allocation of vehicles or parts is inconsistent with the standards set forth in subdivision (a) of Section 11713.3. (Note: there are no comparable provisions for RV dealers.)

Vehicle Code Section	Provision
3065.3(c)	Disputes relating to whether a franchisor's imposition of a facility or equipment policy is inconsistent with the standards set forth in subdivision (a), (b), (c), or (k) of Section 11713.13. ( <u>Note:</u> there are no comparable provisions for RV dealers.)
3065.3(d)	Disputes relating to whether a franchisor is competing with a dealer in violation of subdivision (o) of Section 11713.3. ( <u>Note:</u> there are no comparable provisions for RV dealers.)

#### Separate Protests

A separate protest is required if there is more than one franchise.<sup>4</sup> For example, if a franchised dealer files a single protest to the attempted termination of its Chrysler, Dodge, Jeep, and RAM franchises, consistent with Vehicle Code section 3050 and 13 CCR § 583, the Board requires the dealer to file an amended protest for one of its franchises, i.e., Chrysler, and new protests for the other three franchises, i.e., Dodge, Jeep, and RAM.

# Filing Protest

Most protests have specific statutorily imposed time limits for filing. A protest is deemed filed upon its receipt by the Board via regular mail, email or facsimile,<sup>5</sup> or upon mailing of the protest, if it is sent by either certified or registered mail. Accordingly, it is suggested that all protests be emailed to the Board at <u>nmvb.@nmvb.ca.gov</u> or sent by certified or registered mail to 2415 1<sup>st</sup> Avenue, MS L242, Sacramento, CA 95818.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Vehicle Code section 331 defines a "franchise" in part as follows: "a written agreement between two or more persons having all of the following conditions:

<sup>(1)</sup> A commercial relationship of definite duration or continuing indefinite duration.

<sup>(2)</sup> The franchisee is granted the right to offer for sale or lease, or to sell or lease at retail new motor vehicles or new trailers subject to identification pursuant to Section 5014.1 manufactured or distributed by the franchisor or the right to perform authorized warranty repairs and service, or the right to perform any combination of these activities.

<sup>(3)</sup> The franchisee constitutes a component of the franchisor's distribution system.

<sup>(4)</sup> The operation of the franchisee's business is substantially associated with the franchisor's trademark, trade name, advertising, or other commercial symbol designating the franchisor.

<sup>(5)</sup> The operation of a portion of the franchisee's business is substantially reliant on the franchisor for a continued supply of new vehicles, parts, or accessories."

A recreational vehicle franchise is defined in Vehicle Code section 331.3 as "a written agreement between two or more persons having both of the following conditions: (a) A commercial relationship of definite duration or continuing indefinite duration; and (b) The franchisee is granted the right to offer for sale or lease, or to sell or lease at retail, new recreational vehicles, as defined in subdivision (a) of Section 18010 of the Health and Safety Code, that are manufactured or distributed by the franchisor, or the right to perform authorized warranty repairs and service, or the right to perform any combination of these activities."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> A franchisee seeking to file a protest via facsimile (fax) is requested to contact the Board's legal staff in advance at (916) 445-1888 or <u>nmvb@nmvb.ca.gov</u>.

# Franchisor's Notice of Appearance

The respondent shall file a written notice of appearance within 15 days of receipt of the protest (13 CCR § 585.1). Failure to timely file a notice of appearance shall result in the proceedings being suspended until such time as a notice of appearance is filed.

# Filing Fee

A filing fee of \$200, which should be in the form of a check or money order payable to the New Motor Vehicle Board, must accompany the protest and notice of appearance. Either the protestant or respondent may submit a request for a fee waiver. The Executive Director, upon a showing of good cause, may waive the \$200 filing fee (13 CCR § 553.40). (Samples are available on the Board's website.)

#### Interested Individuals

Per Vehicle Code sections 3066 and 3080, any interested individual may apply to the Board for permission to appear at the hearing on any protest for the purpose of submitting direct evidence concerning the issues raised in the protest.

#### Motion for Intervention

Any person, including a Board member, concerned with the activities or practices of any person applying for or holding a license as a new motor vehicle dealer, manufacturer, manufacturer branch, distributor, distributor branch or representative may file a motion to intervene in a pending protest subject to the conditions set forth in 13 CCR § 551.13.

#### Challenge to Presiding Officer

A party may request disqualification of a Board member or an ALJ for cause prior to the taking of evidence by filing an affidavit stating the grounds for the request (13 CCR § 551.1). Further, 13 CCR § 551.12(b) entitles a party, excluding an intervenor, in a protest to one disqualification without cause (peremptory challenge) of the assigned merits ALJ by filing the peremptory challenge with the Board no later than either 20 days from the date of the order of time and place of hearing identifying the merits ALJ or 20 days prior to the date scheduled for commencement of the merits hearing, whichever is earlier (13 CCR § 551.12(b)(1)). In the event a Board ALJ is unavailable to preside over the merits hearing, an ALJ from the Office of Administrative Hearings ("OAH") will be assigned.<sup>6</sup> A peremptory challenge of the assigned administrative law judge is not authorized for law and motion hearings, settlement conferences, and rulings on discovery disputes. Except for the convenience of the Board or for good cause shown, no merits hearing

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> At the January 25, 2023, General Meeting, the Board added OAH to the "Merit Hearings Judge Assignment Log." This will allow the Board to determine whether OAH is an effective alternative if the Board is unable to retain its merits ALJs. At the April 28, 2023, General Meeting, the Board granted temporary discretion (not to exceed 3 years) to the Executive Director to assign additional merits hearings to OAH outside the current assignment log. Prior to submitting a hearing to OAH that is outside the normal rotation, the Executive Director would seek Executive Committee permission.

shall be continued by the filing of a peremptory challenge.

# **Amicus Curiae Briefs**

The Board, its Executive Director, or an ALJ may, in their discretion, allow the filing of amicus curiae briefs. (13 CCR § 551.13)

# **Table of Contents for Protest Section**

The chart below identifies the section and page numbers for procedural requirements particular to each type of protest but should be relied on only as a guide.

Protest Section of Guide	Page Nos.
Termination of the Franchise	13-17
Modification of the Franchise	18-21
Additional or Relocated Franchise	22-26
Additional or Relocated Satellite Warranty Facility (Motor Vehicle Dealers)	27-30
Compensation for Delivery and Preparation	31-32
Compensation for Warranty Reimbursement (Motor Vehicle Dealers)	33-39
Retail Labor Rate or Retail Parts Rate	40-49
Compensation for Warranty Reimbursement (RV Dealers)	50-52
Compensation for Franchisor Incentive Program Reimbursement (Motor Vehicles Dealers)	53-58
Compensation for Franchisor Incentive Program Reimbursement (RV Dealers)	59-60
Performance Standards	61-64
Allocation of Vehicles or Parts	61-64
Facility or Equipment Policy	61-64
Franchisor Competing with a Dealer	65-66
Hearing Procedures	67-71

# **TERMINATION OF FRANCHISE**

#### **Statutory Authority for Protest**

Vehicle Code sections 3060 and 3070 give the dealer the right to protest an attempt by the manufacturer or distributor to terminate or refuse to continue an existing franchise agreement.

## Franchisor's Notice of Termination

Vehicle Code sections 3060 and 3070 provide that no franchisor (manufacturer or distributor) shall terminate or refuse to continue a franchise (sales and service agreement) unless written notice of the franchisor's intent to terminate has been received by both the franchisee (dealer) and the Board. The notice must set forth the specific grounds for termination and must contain, on the first page thereof in at least 12-point bold type and circumscribed by a line, one of the following statements:

(When a 60-day notice of termination or refusal to continue is given.)

NOTICE TO DEALER: You have the right to file a protest with the NEW MOTOR VEHICLE BOARD in Sacramento and have a hearing in which you may protest the termination of your franchise under provisions of the California Vehicle Code. You must file your protest with the board within 30 calendar days after receiving this notice or within 30 days after the end of any appeal procedure provided by the franchisor or your protest right will be waived.

(When a 15-day notice of termination is given.)

NOTICE TO DEALER: You have the right to file a protest with the NEW MOTOR VEHICLE BOARD in Sacramento and have a hearing in which you may protest the termination of your franchise under provisions of the California Vehicle Code. You must file your protest with the board within 10 calendar days after receiving this notice or within 10 days after the end of any appeal procedure provided by the franchisor or your protest right will be waived.

Termination notices are required to be separately issued to each franchisee and separately issued for each line-make represented by a franchisee. This is consistent with the Vehicle Code and 13 CCR § 593.1. Notices should not be combined to include more than one franchisee nor combined to include more than one line-make. For example, if American Honda seeks to terminate a motorcycle/ATV/scooter dealership and has a separate franchise for each line-make, then there should be three separate termination notices sent to the franchisee and the Board.

# **Time for Filing a Protest**

It is essential not to confuse the time within which to file a protest with the Board with the time at which a termination becomes effective. The time at which the termination will become effective is governed by the reasons for termination. The chart below identifies the reasons for termination, corresponding protest filing periods, and effective dates of termination.

Reason for Termination	Filing Period	Effective Date of Termination
Transfer of any ownership or interest in the franchise without the consent of the franchisor. The consent shall not be unreasonably withheld.	10 days from dealer's receipt of notice or 10 days after the end of any appeal procedure provided by the franchisor.	15 days after dealer's receipt of notice.
Misrepresentation by the franchisee in applying for the franchise.	As above.	As above.
Insolvency of the franchisee, or the filing of any petition by or against the franchisee under any bankruptcy or receivership law.	As above.	As above.
Any unfair business practice after written warning thereof.	As above.	As above.
Failure of the motor vehicle dealer to conduct its customary sales and service operations during its customary hours of business for seven consecutive business days, giving rise to a good faith belief on the part of the franchisor that the motor vehicle (recreational vehicle) dealer is in fact going out of business, except for circumstances beyond the direct control of the motor vehicle (recreational vehicle) dealer or by order of the Department.	As above.	As above.
Any other reason.	30 days from dealer's receipt of notice or 30 days after the end of any appeal procedure provided by the franchisor.	60 days after dealer's receipt of notice.

The protest shall be considered filed on the date of receipt via regular mail, email or facsimile by the Executive Director of the Board or on the date of certified or registered mailing. A document which purports to be a protest will not be "filed" until the Executive Director has reviewed it for compliance with the Board's enabling statutes and regulations. If the Executive Director deems the document complies, it shall be filed as a protest (13 CCR § 598).

Failure of a dealer to file a timely protest with the Board will result in a loss of the right to a hearing before the Board. This could result in automatic termination of the franchise as of the time indicated in the notice of termination. Filing a timely protest will prevent the termination from becoming effective until the protest is resolved by the Board.

# **Required Elements of a Protest**

The required content of a protest under Vehicle Code sections 3060 and 3070 is described in 13 CCR § 585. A protest to the proposed termination or non-renewal of a franchise must contain all of the following (see Appendix for sample Form A):

Content Requirements	Regulatory Authority
Must be in writing and be signed by a franchisee or its attorney. <sup>7</sup>	13 CCR § 583
Must be responsive to the specific grounds of the termination set forth in the notice and set forth clearly and concisely the factual contentions of the franchisee with respect to the matter referred to in the notice.	13 CCR § 585(b)
Must set forth the franchisee's mailing address and telephone number, and the name, mailing address and telephone number of its attorney or authorized agent, if any. All correspondence and notices to the franchisee shall thereafter be addressed to said address, if the dealer principal is presenting its own case, or to the address of the dealer's attorney or agent, if so represented.	13 CCR § 585(d)
Shall indicate either that the franchisee does or does not desire to appear before the Board.	13 CCR § 585(e)
Franchisee shall set forth an estimate of the number of days required to complete the hearing.	13 CCR § 585(f)
Franchisee shall request a pre-hearing conference if one is desired.	13 CCR § 585(g)
Franchisee may submit, as exhibits to the protest, photographic, documentary, or similar physical evidence relevant to the matter with an appropriate description in the protest.	13 CCR § 585(c)
Franchisee shall simultaneously deliver a \$200 filing fee in the form of a check or money order payable to the New Motor Vehicle Board, or a request for a fee waiver.	13 CCR § 553.40
Franchisee shall serve a copy of the protest on the franchisor and proof of service shall accompany the protest submitted to the Board.	13 CCR § 584 13 CCR § 551.24

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> If the franchisee is a natural person, not a corporation or other legal entity, the protest shall be signed by that person or by the franchisee's attorney or representative. If the franchisee is a corporation or other legal entity, the protest shall be signed by an attorney representing the entity, or by an authorized representative of the entity (13 CCR § 583).

# Good Cause

If a timely protest is filed, the manufacturer or distributor cannot terminate the franchise until a hearing has been held and the Board acts on the proposed decision. At a hearing, the manufacturer or distributor will have the burden of proving "good cause" for termination. In making a determination of good cause under Vehicle Code sections 3061 or 3071, the Board shall take into consideration the existing circumstances, including, but not limited to all of the following:

Circumstances	Vehicle Code Section
Amount of business transacted by the franchisee, as compared to the business available to the franchisee.	3061(a), 3071(a)
Investment necessarily made and obligations incurred by the franchisee to perform its part of the franchise.	3061(b), 3071(b)
Permanency of the investment.	3061(c), 3071(c)
Whether it is injurious or beneficial to the public welfare for the franchise to be modified or replaced or the business of the franchisee disrupted.	3061(d), 3071(d)
Whether the franchisee has adequate motor vehicle or recreational vehicle sales and service facilities, equipment, vehicle parts, and qualified service personnel to reasonably provide for the needs of the consumers for the motor vehicles or recreational vehicles handled by the franchisee and has been and is rendering adequate services to the public. (Note: In the case of RVs, not all franchise agreements require service facilities, equipment, vehicle parts, and qualified service personnel.)	3061(e), 3071(e)
Whether the franchisee fails to fulfill the warranty obligations of the franchisor to be performed by the franchisee. ( <u>Note:</u> In the case of RVs, not all franchise agreements require franchisees to have warranty obligations.)	3061(f), 3071(f)
Extent of the franchisee's failure to comply with the terms of the franchise.	3061(g), 3071(g)

#### **Determination of Protest**

If the franchisor, having the burden, cannot establish good cause for terminating the franchise, the protest will be sustained, and the termination will not be permitted.

# **MODIFICATION OF FRANCHISE**

## **Statutory Authority for Protest**

Vehicle Code sections 3060(b) and 3070(b) give the dealer the right to protest an attempt by the manufacturer or distributor to modify or replace an existing franchise such that the modification substantially affects the dealer's sales or service obligations or investment.

#### Franchisor's Notice of Modification

Vehicle Code sections 3060 and 3070 provide that no franchisor shall modify or replace an existing franchise with a succeeding franchise if the modification or replacement would substantially affect the existing franchisee's sales or service obligations or investment, unless written notice of modification or replacement is given to each affected franchisee and the Board at least 60 days prior to the modification or replacement.<sup>8</sup>

The written notice shall contain, on the first page thereof in at least 12-point bold type and circumscribed by a line, the following statement:

NOTICE TO DEALER: Your franchise agreement is being modified or replaced. If the modification or replacement will substantially affect your sales or service obligations or investment, you have the right to file a protest with the NEW MOTOR VEHICLE BOARD in Sacramento and have a hearing in which you may protest the proposed modification or replacement of your franchise under provisions of the California Vehicle Code. You must file your protest with the board within 30 calendar days of your receipt of this notice or within 30 days after the end of any appeal procedure provided by the franchisor or your protest rights will be waived.

Modification notices are required to be separately issued to each franchisee and separately issued for each line-make represented by a franchisee. This is consistent with the Vehicle Code and 13 CCR § 593.1. Notices should not be combined to include more than one franchisee nor combined to include more than one line-make.

#### Time for Filing a Protest

Filing a timely protest will prevent the modification from becoming effective until the protest is resolved by the Board. It is essential not to confuse the time within which to file a protest with the Board with the time at which a modification becomes effective. The chart below identifies the protest filing period and effective date of modification:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Despite the franchisor's decision that the notices to the franchisee and the Board are not required, to avoid a claim that it has violated any of the Vehicle Code provisions, a franchisor may decide to issue notices that comply with the statutes. The franchisor also may at the same time expressly state, along with the notices or in the notices themselves, that the franchisor believes that the notices were not required and also claim that there is no right in the franchisee to file a protest despite the notices stating to the contrary (as required by the statutory language).

Reason for Modification	Filing Period	Effective Date of Modification
As stated by franchisor.	30 days from dealer's receipt of notice or 30 days after the end of any appeal procedure provided by the franchisor.	60 days after dealer's receipt of notice.

The protest shall be considered filed on the date of receipt via regular mail, email or facsimile by the Executive Director of the Board or on the date of certified or registered mailing. A document which purports to be a protest will not be "filed" until the Executive Director has reviewed it for compliance with the Board's enabling statutes and regulations. If the Executive Director deems the document complies, it shall be filed as a protest (13 CCR § 598).

Failure of a dealer to file a timely protest with the Board will result in a loss of the right to a hearing before the Board. This could result in the modification becoming effective as stated in the notice. Filing a timely protest will prevent the modification or replacement from becoming effective until the protest is resolved by the Board.

# **Required Elements of Protest**

The required content of a protest under Vehicle Code sections 3060 and 3070 is described in 13 CCR § 585. A protest of modification or replacement of an existing franchise must contain all of the following (see Appendix for sample Form A):

Content Requirements	Regulatory Authority
Must be in writing and be signed by a franchisee or its attorney. <sup>9</sup>	13 CCR § 583
Must be responsive to the specific grounds of the modification or	13 CCR § 585(b)
replacement set forth in the notice and set forth clearly and concisely	
the factual contentions of the franchisee with respect to the matter	
referred to in the notice.	
Must set forth the franchisee's mailing address and telephone	13 CCR § 585(d)
number, and the name, mailing address and telephone number of its	
attorney or authorized agent, if any. All correspondence and notices	
to the franchisee shall thereafter be addressed to said address, if the	
dealer principal is presenting its own case, or to the address of the	
dealer's attorney or agent, if so represented.	
Shall indicate either that the franchisee does or does not desire to	13 CCR § 585(e)
appear before the Board.	
Franchisee shall set forth an estimate of the number of days required	13 CCR § 585(f)
to complete the hearing.	
Franchisee shall request a pre-hearing conference if one is desired.	13 CCR § 585(g)
Franchisee may submit, as exhibits to the protest, photographic,	13 CCR § 585(c)
documentary, or similar physical evidence relevant to the matter with	
an appropriate description in the protest.	
Franchisee shall simultaneously deliver a \$200 filing fee in the form of	13 CCR § 553.40
a check or money order payable to the New Motor Vehicle Board, or	_
a request for a fee waiver.	
Franchisee shall serve a copy of the protest on the franchisor and	13 CCR § 584
proof of service shall accompany the protest submitted to the Board.	13 CCR § 551.24

# Good Cause

If a timely protest is filed, the manufacturer or distributor cannot modify the franchise if such modification would substantially affect a dealer's sales or service obligations or investment until a hearing has been held by the Board. At the hearing, the dealer has the initial burden to establish that there is a proposed modification, which would substantially affect the dealer's sales or service obligations or investment. If the dealer meets this burden, the burden of proof shifts to the manufacturer or distributor to prove "good cause" for the modification. In making a determination of good cause pursuant to Vehicle Code sections 3061 or 3071, the Board shall take into consideration the existing circumstances, including, but not limited to, all of the following:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> See footnote 7.

Circumstances	Vehicle Code Section
Amount of business transacted by the franchisee, as compared to	3061(a), 3071(a)
the business available to the franchisee.	
Investment necessarily made and obligations incurred by the	3061(b), 3071(b)
franchisee to perform its part of the franchise.	
Permanency of the investment.	3061(c), 3071(c)
Whether it is injurious or beneficial to the public welfare for the	3061(d), 3071(d)
franchise to be modified or replaced or the business of the	
franchisee disrupted.	
Whether the franchisee has adequate motor vehicle or recreational	3061(e), 3071(e)
vehicle sales and service facilities, equipment, vehicle parts, and	
qualified service personnel to reasonably provide for the needs of	
the consumers for the motor vehicles or recreational vehicles	
handled by the franchisee and has been and is rendering adequate	
services to the public. ( <u>Note:</u> In the case of RVs, not all franchise	
agreements require service facilities, equipment, vehicle parts, and	
qualified service personnel.)	
Whether the franchisee fails to fulfill the warranty obligations of the	3061(f), 3071(f)
franchisor to be performed by the franchisee. (Note: In the case of	
RVs, not all franchise agreements require franchisees to have	
warranty obligations.)	
Extent of the franchisee's failure to comply with the terms of the	3061(g), 3071(g)
franchise.	

# **Determination of Protest**

The modification will not be permitted if the Board decides the manufacturer or distributor failed to establish good cause for the intended modification.

If a replacement franchise is the successor franchise to an expiring or expired term franchise, the prior franchise shall continue in effect until resolution of the protest by the Board. In the event of multiple protests, hearings shall be consolidated to expedite the disposition of the issue.

# ADDITIONAL OR RELOCATED FRANCHISE

## **Statutory Authority for Protest**

Vehicle Code sections 3062(a)(1) and 3072(a)(1) give a dealer the right to protest the establishment of an additional dealership or relocation of an existing dealership of the same linemake within a ten-mile radius of the proposed new or relocating dealership. Any protest filed pursuant to this section is, by statute, filed against the manufacturer or distributor that is attempting to establish or relocate one of its dealers.

**NOTE:** The proposed new dealer, or the existing dealer seeking to relocate, may appear in the proceedings as an interested individual. The rights of an interested individual to participate in the proceedings are somewhat limited, and subject to the ALJ's management of the hearing. In general, interested individuals have no right to formal discovery or right of cross-examination at the hearing.

# Franchisor's Notice of Additional or Relocated Franchise

Vehicle Code sections 3062(a)(1) and 3072(a)(1)<sup>10</sup> require that the manufacturer or distributor must first give written notice to the Board and to dealerships of the "same line-make" within the "relevant market area" of the proposed new or relocating dealership.

The written notice shall contain, on the first page thereof in at least 12-point bold type and circumscribed by a line, the following statement:

NOTICE TO DEALER: You have the right to file a protest with the NEW MOTOR VEHICLE BOARD in Sacramento and have a hearing on your protest under the terms of the California Vehicle Code if you oppose this action. You must file your protest with the board within 20 days of your receipt of this notice, or within 20 days after the end of any appeal procedure that is provided by us to you. If within this time you file with the board a request for additional time to file a protest, the board or its executive director, upon a showing of good cause, may grant you an additional 10 days to file the protest.

Establishment and relocation notices are required to be separately issued to each franchisee and separately issued for each line-make represented by a franchisee. This is consistent with the Vehicle Code and 13 CCR § 593.1. Notices should not be combined to include more than one franchisee nor combined to include more than one line-make. For example, if General Motors LLC seeks to establish an additional Buick/Cadillac/GMC dealership and has a separate franchise for each line-make, then there should be separate establishment notices sent to each franchisee of any of the three line-makes within the relevant market area of the proposed new location (as defined in Vehicle Code section 507) and the Board.

For motor vehicles other than RVs, "line-make" is not defined in the code. What is or is not a same

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> The last sentence in the "Notice to Dealer" language in Section 3072(a) contains commas as follows: "If, within this time, you file with the board . . ."

"line-make" is obvious in most situations. However, gray areas can exist. In this Guide, the working definition of "line-make" for the automobile industry corresponds to that used by the Department as a classification system for registering vehicles, licensing dealers, and resolving questions related to OL 124 Form (Certificate of Proposed Franchise) relevant market area requirements. For instance, in the automotive industry, a manufacturer such as General Motors would have several "makes" including Buick, Chevrolet, and Cadillac. Each "make", in turn, would be comprised of several "lines" or models, e.g., Chevrolet has Silverado and Tahoe "lines" or models.

For the RV industry, which lacks uniformity, "recreational vehicle line-make" is defined in Vehicle Code section 3072.5 as: "a group or groups of recreational vehicles defined by the terms of a written agreement that complies with Section 331.3." It is essential that RV franchisors are precise when defining a line-make in RV franchise agreements and ensure that their makes are registered with the Department.

Relevant market area is defined in Vehicle Code section 507 as "any area within a radius of 10 miles from the site of a potential new dealership." The distance is determined by a straight-line measurement between the nearest points of the new dealership's location and the protesting dealership's location. There are times when a survey will be necessary to determine whether a dealer desiring to protest is within the relevant market area.

# Exceptions to the Right to Protest

# New Motor Vehicle Dealers (including RVs)

There are exceptions to the requirement of notice to existing dealers within the relevant market area of a franchisor's intent to establish or relocate a dealership. These exceptions are located in Vehicle Code sections 3062 and 3072, and provide that no notice is required to be given, and there is no right to protest, if:

- 1. The relocation is of an existing dealership to a location that is both within the same city as, and is within one mile from, the existing (relocating) dealership location;
- 2. The establishment of a dealership at the same location of a dealership that has been out of operation for less than one year;
- 3. The relocation entails the establishment at a location of a dealership that is both within the same city as, and is within one-quarter mile from, the location of a dealership of the same line-make that has been out of operation for less than 90 days; or
- 4. The establishment entails a display of vehicles at fairs, expositions, or similar exhibits provided that no actual sales are made at the event and the display does not exceed 30 days.

Vehicle Code sections 3062 and 3072 require that if an "off-site sale" is intended, the manufacturer or distributor must give notice to all dealers of the same line-make within 10 miles of the proposed site. Such dealers would have a right to protest the off-site sale, even though a financial institution and a licensed dealer sponsor the event.

# Recreational Vehicle Dealers Only

For RVs, the exceptions to notice requirements are found in Vehicle Code section 3072. The exceptions are essentially the same as provided in Vehicle Code 3062 as stated above with the addition of one more exception. That one exception is for an annual show sponsored by a national trade association of recreational vehicle manufacturers that complies with all of the requirements of subdivision (d) of Vehicle Code section 11713.15.<sup>11</sup> (Veh. Code § 3072(b)(4))

# Time for Filing a Protest

Filing a timely protest will preclude the manufacturer or distributor from establishing or relocating the dealership until the Board resolves the protest.

The chart below identifies the protest filing period and effective date of the relocation or establishment of a dealership.

Type of Notice	Filing Period	Effective Date of Relocation/ Establishment
A notice by franchisor of intent to establish or relocate franchisee.	20 days from dealer's receipt of notice or 20 days after the end of any appeal procedure provided by the franchisor, whichever is later.	As stated by franchisor.

If, within the above filing period, a franchisee files with the Board a request for additional time to file a protest, the Board or its Executive Director, on a showing of good cause, may grant an additional 10 days to file the protest.

If no protest is filed, or if the protest is not filed within the statutory filing period, the manufacturer or distributor will be able to establish the proposed dealership or relocate the existing dealership without proceeding before the Board.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Effective September 19, 2018, subdivision (d) of Vehicle Code section 11713.15 was amended to except a recreational vehicle dealer being issued a temporary branch license from the notice requirements if the show is located in a county with a population of 9,000,000 or more persons, or at a location within 30 miles from the prior approved location of the show, and at least 10 manufacturers are participating in the show. (Assembly Bill 2330, Stats. 2018, Ch. 537)

# **Required Elements of Protest**

The required content of a protest pursuant to Vehicle Code sections 3062 and 3072 is set forth in detail in 13 CCR § 585. A protest of the relocation or establishment of a franchise must contain all of the following (see Appendix for sample Form A):

Content Requirements	Regulatory Authority
Must be in writing and be signed by a franchisee or its attorney. <sup>12</sup>	13 CCR § 583
Must be responsive to the specific grounds of the establishment or relocation set forth in the notice and set forth clearly and concisely the factual contentions of the franchisee with respect to the matter referred to in the notice.	13 CCR § 585(b)
Must set forth the franchisee's mailing address and telephone number, and the name, mailing address and telephone number of its attorney or authorized agent, if any. All correspondence and notices to the franchisee shall thereafter be addressed to said address, if the dealer principal is presenting its own case, or to the address of the dealer's attorney or agent, if so represented.	13 CCR § 585(d)
Shall indicate either that the franchisee does or does not desire to appear before the Board.	13 CCR § 585(e)
Franchisee shall set forth an estimate of the number of days required to complete the hearing.	13 CCR § 585(f)
Franchisee shall request a pre-hearing conference if one is desired.	13 CCR § 585(g)
Franchisee may submit, as exhibits to the protest, photographic, documentary, or similar physical evidence relevant to the matter with an appropriate description in the protest.	13 CCR § 585(c)
Franchisee shall simultaneously deliver a \$200 filing fee in the form of a check or money order payable to the New Motor Vehicle Board, or a request for a fee waiver.	13 CCR § 553.40
Franchisee shall serve a copy of the protest on the franchisor and proof of service shall accompany the protest submitted to the Board.	13 CCR § 584 13 CCR § 551.24

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> See footnote 7.

# Good Cause

If a timely protest is filed, the manufacturer or distributor cannot establish an additional franchise or relocate an existing franchise until the protest is resolved by the Board. At the hearing, the protesting dealer has the burden of proving that there is good cause to prevent the establishment of the additional dealer or relocation of an existing dealership. In making a determination of good cause pursuant to Vehicle Code sections 3063 or 3073, the Board shall take into consideration the existing circumstances, including, but not limited to, all of the following:

Circumstances	Vehicle Code Section
Permanency of the investment.	3063(a), 3073(a)
Effect on the retail motor vehicle (recreational vehicle)	3063(b), 3073(b)
business and the consuming public in the relevant market	
area.	
Whether it is injurious to the public welfare for an additional	3063(c), 3073(c)
franchise to be established or an existing dealership to be relocated.	
Whether the franchisees of the same line-make or same recreational vehicle line-make in the relevant market area are providing adequate competition and convenient consumer care for the motor vehicles of the line-make or recreational vehicle line-make in the market area. This includes the adequacy of motor vehicle or recreational vehicle sales and service facilities, equipment, supply of vehicle parts, and qualified service personnel. ( <u>Note:</u> For RVs, adequate sales shall be considered, however, not all RV franchise agreements require service facilities, equipment, supply of vehicle parts, and qualified service personnel.)	3063(d), 3073(d)
Whether the establishment of an additional franchise would	3063(e), 3073(e)
	3063(e), 3073(e)

# **Determination of Protest**

If the Board decides the protesting dealer cannot prove good cause to prevent the establishment or relocation, the manufacturer or distributor will be permitted to proceed with its intended action.

# ADDITIONAL OR RELOCATED SATELLITE WARRANTY FACILITY

# **Statutory Authority for Protest**

Vehicle Code section 3062(a)(2) gives a new motor vehicle dealer the right to protest an additional satellite warranty facility or the relocation of an existing satellite warranty facility within 2 miles of any dealership of the same line-make. Satellite warranty facility is defined as "a facility operated by a franchisee where authorized warranty repairs and service are performed and the offer for sale or lease, the display for sale or lease, or the sale or lease of new motor vehicles is not authorized to take place." (Veh. Code § 3062(e)(2)) Any protest filed pursuant to this section is, by statute, filed against the manufacturer or distributor that is attempting to establish or relocate one of its satellite warranty facilities. There are no comparable statutory provisions for RV dealers for such protests.

# Franchisor's Notice of Additional or Relocated Satellite Warranty Facility

Vehicle Code section 3062(a)(2) requires that the manufacturer or distributor must first give written notice to the Board and to dealerships of the same line-make within 2 miles of the proposed location.

The written notice shall contain, on the first page thereof in at least 12-point bold type and circumscribed by a line, the following statement:

NOTICE TO DEALER: You have the right to file a protest with the NEW MOTOR VEHICLE BOARD in Sacramento and have a hearing on your protest under the terms of the California Vehicle Code if you oppose this action. You must file your protest with the board within 20 days of your receipt of this notice, or within 20 days after the end of any appeal procedure that is provided by us to you. If within this time you file with the board a request for additional time to file a protest, the board or its executive director, upon a showing of good cause, may grant you an additional 10 days to file the protest.

The notices are required to be separately issued to each franchisee and separately issued for each line-make represented by a franchisee. This is consistent with the Vehicle Code and 13 CCR § 593.1. Notices should not be combined to include more than one franchisee nor combined to include more than one line-make.

# Time for Filing a Protest

Filing a timely protest will preclude the manufacturer or distributor from establishing or relocating the satellite warranty facility until the protest is resolved by the Board. The chart on the next page identifies the protest filing period and effective date of the relocation or establishment of a satellite warranty facility.

If, within the filing period set forth in the table, a franchisee files with the Board a request for additional time to file a protest, the Board or its Executive Director, on a showing of good cause, may grant an additional 10 days to file the protest.

If no protest is filed, or if the protest is not filed in time, the manufacturer or distributor will be able to establish the proposed satellite warranty facility or relocate the existing satellite warranty facility without proceeding before the Board.

Type of Notice	Filing Period	Effective Date of Relocation/ Establishment
A notice by franchisor of intent	20 days from dealer's receipt of notice	As stated by franchisor.
to establish or relocate franchisee.	or 20 days after the end of any appeal procedure provided by the franchisor, whichever is later.	

# **Required Elements of Protest**

The required content of a protest under Vehicle Code section 3062(a)(2) is described in 13 CCR § 585. A protest of the relocation or establishment of a satellite warranty facility must contain all of the following (see Appendix for sample Form A):

Content Requirements	<b>Regulatory Authority</b>
Must be in writing and be signed by a franchisee or its attorney. <sup>13</sup>	13 CCR § 583
Must be responsive to the specific grounds of the establishment	13 CCR § 585(b)
or relocation of the satellite warranty facility set forth in the notice	
and set forth clearly and concisely the factual contentions of the	
franchisee with respect to the matter referred to in the notice.	
Must set forth the franchisee's mailing address and telephone	13 CCR § 585(d)
number, and the name, mailing address and telephone number of	
its attorney or authorized agent, if any. All correspondence and	
notices to the franchisee shall thereafter be addressed to said	
address, if the dealer principal is presenting its own case, or to	
the address of the dealer's attorney or agent, if so represented.	
Shall indicate either that the franchisee does or does not desire to	13 CCR § 585(e)
appear before the Board.	
Franchisee shall set forth an estimate of the number of days	13 CCR § 585(f)
required to complete the hearing.	
Franchisee shall request a pre-hearing conference if one is	13 CCR § 585(g)
desired.	
Franchisee may submit, as exhibits to the protest, photographic,	13 CCR § 585(c)
documentary, or similar physical evidence relevant to the matter	
with an appropriate description in the protest.	
Franchisee shall simultaneously deliver a \$200 filing fee in the	13 CCR § 553.40
form of a check or money order payable to the New Motor	
Vehicle Board, or a request for a fee waiver.	
Franchisee shall serve a copy of the protest on the franchisor and	13 CCR § 584
proof of service shall accompany the protest submitted to the	13 CCR § 551.24
Board.	

# Good Cause

If a timely protest is filed, the manufacturer or distributor cannot establish an additional satellite warranty facility or relocate an existing satellite warranty facility until the protest is resolved by the Board. At the hearing, the protesting dealer has the burden of proving that there is good cause to prevent the establishment of the additional satellite warranty facility or relocation of an existing satellite warranty facility or relocation of an existing satellite warranty facility.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> See footnote 7.

In making a determination of good cause pursuant to Vehicle Code section 3063, the Board shall take into consideration the existing circumstances, including, but not limited to, all of the following:

Circumstances	Vehicle Code Section
Permanency of the investment.	3063(a)
Effect on the retail motor vehicle business and the consuming public in the relevant market area.	3063(b)
Whether it is injurious to the public welfare for an additional franchise to be established or an existing dealership to be relocated.	3063(c)
Whether the franchisees of the same line-make in the relevant market area are providing adequate competition and convenient consumer care for the motor vehicles of the line-make in the market area, which shall include the adequacy of motor vehicle sales and service facilities, equipment, supply of vehicle parts, and qualified service personnel.	3063(d)
Whether the establishment of an additional franchise would increase competition and therefore be in the public interest.	3063(e)

#### **Determination of Protest**

If the Board decides the protesting dealer is unable to prove good cause not to allow the establishment or relocation of the satellite warranty facility, the manufacturer or distributor will be permitted to proceed with its intended action.

# **COMPENSATION FOR DELIVERY AND PREPARATION**

#### Statutory Authority

Vehicle Code sections 3064 and 3074 require every new motor vehicle or recreational vehicle manufacturer and distributor to specify the dealer's delivery and preparation obligations prior to the delivery of new motor vehicles or new recreational vehicles to retail buyers.

#### Franchisor's Notice of Compensation for Delivery and Preparation

Manufacturers and distributors are required to file with the Board a copy of the delivery and preparation obligations and a schedule of compensation to be paid to the dealers for the work and services they are required to perform in connection with the delivery and preparation obligations. The schedule of compensation must be reasonable with the issue of reasonableness being subject to the approval of the Board. In order to initiate Board action, a franchisee must file a protest with the Board.

#### Time for Filing a Protest

There is no specific statutory time period in the Vehicle Code within which to file a protest involving delivery and preparation obligations and compensation. Failure to file a protest within a reasonable time, however, could result in a dealer losing the right to a hearing by the Board.

# Required Elements of Protest

The required content of a protest under Vehicle Code sections 3064 and 3074 is described in 13 CCR § 586. A protest involving delivery and preparation obligations must contain all of the following (see Appendix for sample Form A):

Content Requirements	Regulatory Authority
Must be in writing and be signed by a franchisee or its attorney. <sup>14</sup>	13 CCR § 583
Must set forth in clear and concise language the factual contentions of the franchisee with respect to the protest.	13 CCR § 586(a)(1)
Must set forth the franchisee's mailing address and telephone number, and the name, mailing address and telephone number of its attorney or authorized agent, if any. All correspondence and notices to the franchisee shall thereafter be addressed to said address, if the dealer principal is presenting its own case, or to the address of the dealer's attorney or agent, if so represented.	13 CCR § 586(a)(3)
Shall indicate either that the franchisee does or does not desire to appear before the Board.	13 CCR § 586(a)(4)
Franchisee may submit, as exhibits to the protest, photographic, documentary, or similar physical evidence relevant to the matter with an appropriate description in the protest.	13 CCR § 586(a)(2)
Franchisee shall simultaneously deliver a \$200 filing fee in the form of a check or money order payable to the New Motor Vehicle Board, or a request for a fee waiver.	13 CCR § 553.40
Franchisee shall serve a copy of the protest on the franchisor and proof of service shall accompany the protest submitted to the Board.	13 CCR § 584 13 CCR § 551.24

# **Determination of Protest**

If a dealer files a protest challenging the reasonableness of the schedule, the Board will resolve the dispute in light of all the relevant circumstances including, but not limited to, the time required to perform each function.

If there is a hearing, the dealer has the burden of proving that the schedule of compensation is not reasonable (Veh. Code §§ 3066(c) and 3080(c)).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> See footnote 7.

# WARRANTY CLAIMS - Motor Vehicle Dealers

# Franchisor's Notice of Compensation for Warranty Reimbursement

Vehicle Code section 3065(a) requires every new motor vehicle manufacturer or distributor (franchisor) to properly fulfill every warranty agreement made by it and to adequately and fairly compensate its dealers (franchisees) for labor and parts used to satisfy the warranty obligations of the franchisor, including but not limited to diagnostics, repair, service, and all other conditions of the obligation, including costs directly associated with the disposal of hazardous materials that are associated with a warranty repair. (Veh. Code § 3065(a))

Franchisors are required to use time allowances for the diagnosis and performance of work and service that are reasonable and adequate for a qualified technician to perform the work or services. (Veh. Code § 3065(a)(1))

Additionally, "[a] franchisor shall not unreasonably deny a written request submitted by a franchisee for modification of a franchisor's uniform time allowance for a specific warranty repair, or a request submitted by a franchisee for an additional time allowance for either diagnostic or repair work on a specific vehicle covered under warranty, provided the request includes any information and documentation reasonably required by the franchisor to assess the merits of the franchisee's request." (Veh. Code § 3065(a)(1))

Manufacturers and distributors are required to file copies of their warranty reimbursement schedules with the Board, which must be reasonable with respect to the time and compensation allowed to the dealer for the performance of warranty diagnostics, repair, and service. (Veh. Code § 3065(a))

# Reasonableness of the Warranty Reimbursement Schedule

Subdivision (b) of Section 3065 was amended to clarify what constitutes a reasonable warranty reimbursement schedule: "a franchisor shall compensate each of its franchisees for parts and labor at rates equal to the franchisee's retail labor rate and retail parts rate, as established pursuant to Section 3065.2." Effective January 1, 2020, a franchisee no longer has a protest right to contest the reasonableness of its franchisor's warranty reimbursement schedule or formula. (Veh. Code § 3065(b))

A franchisee and a franchisor can enter into a "voluntary written agreement signed by both parties that compensates for labor and parts used to satisfy the warranty obligations of the franchisor at rates other than the franchisee's retail rates, provided that the warranty reimbursement schedule adequately and fairly compensates the franchisee." (Veh. Code § 3065(b))

# Protest of Pre-Repair Challenges to the Reduction in Time and Compensation (Labor Time Guides) Applicable to Specific Parts or Labor Operations

Manufacturers and distributors are prohibited from imposing a fixed percentage or other reduction in the time or compensation allowed to the dealer for warranty repairs not attributable to a specific repair. (Veh. Code § 3065(a)(2))

The time or compensation applicable to a specific warranty repair may be reduced only upon 15 days' prior written notice to the dealer. (Veh. Code § 3065(a)(2))

A franchisee can file a protest to challenge the reduction in time or compensation applicable to specific parts or labor operations. The protest needs to be filed within 6 months "following the franchisee's receipt of notice of the reduction." If there is a hearing, the franchisor has the burden of "establishing the reasonableness of the reduction and adequacy and fairness of the resulting reduction in time or compensation." (Veh. Code § 3065(a)(3))

#### Approval of Warranty Claims

Vehicle Code section 3065(d)(1) requires that warranty claims be approved or disapproved within 30 days after their receipt by the franchisor. Any claim not specifically disapproved in writing within 30 days from receipt by the franchisor shall be deemed approved on the 30<sup>th</sup> day.

Approved warranty claims must be paid within 30 days of approval. However, Vehicle Code section 3065(d)(5) provides that failure to approve or pay within these time limits, in individual instances for reasons beyond the reasonable control of the franchisor, do not violate Article 4 (pertains to motor vehicles other than RVs).

#### **Disapproval of Warranty Claims for a Defective Part**

Vehicle Code section 3065(c) requires the franchisor that disallows a franchisee's warranty claim for a defective part on the basis that the part was not defective must return the part to the franchisee at the franchisor's expense, or reimburse the franchisee for the part, at the franchisor's option.

#### **Disapproval of Warranty Claims**

A franchisor shall not disapprove a claim unless the claim meets one of the following categories:

- 1. False;
- 2. Fraudulent;
- 3. Repairs were not properly made;
- 4. Repairs were inappropriate to correct a warranty failure due to an improper act or omission of the franchisee; or
- 5. Material noncompliance with reasonable and nondiscriminatory documentation and administrative claims submission requirements. (Veh. Code § 3065(d)(2))

A franchisor who disapproves a claim is required to notify the franchisee in writing of the disapproval 30 days after receipt by the franchisor and each notice shall state the specific grounds upon which the disapproval is based. (Veh. Code § 3065(d)(3))

# Protest of Initial Disapproval of Warranty Claims

A franchisee can file a protest of the initial disapproval of a warranty claim within 6 months after receipt of the written notice. If there is a hearing, the franchisor has the burden of proof. (Veh. Code 3065(d)(6))

#### Franchisor Provided "Reasonable" Appeal Process

Vehicle Code section 3065(d)(3) requires franchisors to provide a reasonable appeal process that allows the franchisee at least 30 days after receipt of the written disapproval notice to provide additional supporting documentation or information rebutting the disapproval.

If the disapproval is based upon noncompliance with documentation or administrative claims submission requirements, the franchisor shall allow the franchisee at least 30 days from the date of receipt of the notice to cure any material noncompliance.

If the disapproval is rebutted and material noncompliance is cured before the applicable deadline, the franchisor shall approve the claim.

There are potentially two 30-day time periods: (1) reasonable appeal; and (2) opportunity to cure.

#### Final Denial of Warranty Claim

If the franchisee provides additional supporting documentation or information purporting to rebut the disapproval, attempts to cure noncompliance relating to the claim, or otherwise appeals denial of the claim and the franchisor continues to deny the claim, the franchisor shall provide the franchisee with a written notification of the final denial within 30 days of completion of the appeal process, which shall conspicuously state "Final Denial" on the first page. (Veh. Code § 3065(d)(4))

# Protest of Final Denial of Warranty Claim following a Franchisor's Appeal Process

A franchisee can file a protest of the final denial of a warranty claim following a franchisor's appeal process within 6 months after receipt of the written notice. If there is a hearing, the franchisor has the burden of proof. (Veh. Code § 3065(d)(6))

#### Audits of Franchisee Warranty Records

Audits of franchisee warranty records may be conducted by the franchisor on a reasonable basis, and for a period of 9 months after a claim is paid or a credit issued.

A franchisor shall not select a franchisee for an audit, or perform an audit, in a punitive, retaliatory, or unfairly discriminatory manner.

A franchisor may conduct no more than one random audit of a franchisee in a 9-month period.

The franchisor's notification to the franchisee of any additional audit within a 9-month period shall

be accompanied by written disclosure of the basis for that additional audit. (Veh. Code § 3065(e)(1))

If a false claim was submitted by a franchisee with the intent to defraud the franchisor, a longer period for audit and any resulting chargeback may be permitted if the franchisor obtains an order from the Board. (Veh. Code § 3065(f))

# Disapproval of Previously Approved Warranty Claims

Previously approved claims shall not be disapproved or charged back to the dealer unless the claim meets one of the following categories:

- 1. False;
- 2. Fraudulent;
- 3. Repairs were not properly made;
- 4. Repairs were inappropriate to correct a warranty failure due to an improper act or omission of the franchisee; or
- 5. Material noncompliance with reasonable and nondiscriminatory documentation and administrative claims submission requirements. (Veh. Code § 3065(e)(2))

A franchisor shall not disapprove or chargeback a claim based upon an extrapolation from a sample of claims, unless the sample of claims is selected randomly, and the extrapolation is performed in a reasonable and statistically valid manner.

If the franchisor disapproves of a previously approved claim following an audit, within 30 days after the audit, the franchisor shall provide to the franchisee a written disapproval notice stating the specific grounds upon which the claim is disapproved. (Veh. Code § 3065(e)(3))

# Protest of Warranty Claim Disapproval of a Previously Approved Claim Following an Audit

A franchisee can file a protest of the warranty claim disapproval of a previously approved claim following an audit within 6 months after receipt of the written notice. If there is a hearing, the franchisor has the burden of proof. (Veh. Code § 3065(e)(6))

#### Franchisor Provided "Reasonable" Appeal Process

Vehicle Code section 3065(e)(3) requires franchisors to provide a reasonable appeal process that allows the franchisee a reasonable period of not less than 30 days after receipt of the written disapproval notice to respond to any disapproval with additional supporting documentation or information rebutting the disapproval and to cure noncompliance, with the period commensurate with the volume of claims under consideration.

If the franchisee rebuts any disapproval and cures any material noncompliance relating to a claim before the applicable deadline, the franchisor shall not chargeback the franchisee for that claim.

# Final Denial of Warranty Claim Following an Audit

If the franchisee provides additional supporting documentation or information purporting to rebut the disapproval, attempts to cure noncompliance relating to the claim, or otherwise appeals denial of the claim and the franchisor continues to deny the claim, the franchisor shall provide the franchisee with a written notification of the final denial within 30 days of completion of the appeal process, which shall conspicuously state "Final Denial" on the first page. (Veh. Code § 3065(e)(4))

#### <u>Protest of Final Denial of Warranty Claim Following an Audit Following the Franchisor's</u> <u>Appeal Process</u>

A franchisee can file a protest of the final denial of a warranty claim following an audit following the franchisor's appeal process within 6 months after receipt of the written notice. If there is a hearing, the franchisor has the burden of proof. (Veh. Code § 3065(e)(6))

#### Franchisor Chargeback for Warranty Claims

Vehicle Code section 3065(e)(5) provides that the franchisor shall not chargeback the franchisee until 45 days after receipt of the written disapproval of a previously approved claim following an audit or final denial of warranty claim following an audit following the franchisor's appeal process, whichever is later.

Any chargeback to a franchisee for warranty parts or service compensation shall be made within 90 days of receipt of that written notice.

If the franchisee files a protest pursuant to this subdivision prior to the franchisor's chargeback for denied claims, the franchisor shall not offset or otherwise undertake to collect the chargeback until the Board issues a final order on the protest.

If the Board sustains the chargeback or the protest is dismissed, the franchisor shall have 90 days following issuance of the final order or the dismissal to make the chargeback, unless otherwise provided in a settlement agreement.

In summary, days 45-90 are the only days to chargeback a dealer for warranty claims. A manufacturer or distributor cannot chargeback a dealer before day 44, or after day 91. But if a protest is filed prior to a chargeback, then the franchisor cannot chargeback the dealer during the above time period. It must wait until the Board decides the protest and if the protest is dismissed or the Board sustains the chargeback, then the franchisor can chargeback the dealer but must do so within 90 days after the Board action (or within time period allowed by settlement agreement, if any).

However, if a false claim was submitted by a franchisee with the intent to defraud the franchisor, a longer period for an audit and any resulting chargeback may be permitted if the franchisor obtains an order from the Board. (Veh. Code § 3065(f))

# **Required Elements of Protest**

The required content of a protest under Vehicle Code section 3065 is described in 13 CCR § 586. A protest involving warranty claims must contain all of the following (see Appendix for sample Form A):

Content Requirements	<b>Regulatory Authority</b>
Must be in writing and be signed by a franchisee or its	13 CCR § 583
attorney. <sup>15</sup>	40.000 0 500(-)(4)
Must set forth in clear and concise language the factual	13 CCR § 586(a)(1)
contentions of the franchisee with respect to the protest.	
Must set forth the franchisee's mailing address and	13 CCR § 586(a)(3)
telephone number, and the name, mailing address and	
telephone number of its attorney or authorized agent, if any.	
All correspondence and notices to the franchisee shall	
thereafter be addressed to said address, if the dealer	
principal is presenting its own case, or to the address of the	
dealer's attorney or agent, if so represented.	
Shall indicate either that the franchisee does or does not	13 CCR § 586(a)(4)
desire to appear before the Board.	
Franchisee may submit, as exhibits to the protest,	13 CCR § 586(a)(2)
photographic, documentary, or similar physical evidence	
relevant to the matter with an appropriate description in the	
protest.	
Franchisee shall simultaneously deliver a \$200 filing fee in	13 CCR § 553.40
the form of a check or money order payable to the New	
Motor Vehicle Board, or a request for a fee waiver.	
Franchisee shall serve a copy of the protest on the franchisor	13 CCR § 584
and proof of service shall accompany the protest submitted	13 CCR § 551.24
to the Board.	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> See footnote 7.

# WARRANTY CLAIMS PROTESTS Motor Vehicle Dealers

Vehicle Code Section	Type of Protest	Notice to Dealer	Time to File Protest	Burden of Proof if there is a Hearing
3065(a)	<b>Pre-Repair</b> Challenge to the reduction in time and compensation (labor time guides) applicable to specific parts or labor operations	Written notice of reduction provided by the franchisor to the franchisee.	Within 6 months following the franchisee's receipt of the written notice of reduction	Franchisor has burden to establish the reasonableness of the reduction and adequacy and fairness of the resulting compensation (3065(a))
3065(d)(3)	Post-Repair Initial disapproval of warranty claims	Franchisor provides a written notice of disapproval within 30 days after the franchisor's receipt of a warranty claim submitted by a franchisee.	Within 6 months after receipt of the written notice	Franchisor has the burden (3065(d)(6))
3065(d)(4)	Post-Repair/Post- Appeal Final denial of warranty claim following franchisor's appeal process	Notice of Final Denial to the franchisee.	Within 6 months after receipt of the written notice	Franchisor has the burden (3065(d)(6))
3065(e)(3)	<b>Post-Audit</b> Warranty claim disapproval of a previously approved claim following an audit	Franchisor provides a written Notice of Disapproval within 30 days after the audit stating the specific grounds.	Within 6 months after receipt of the written notice	Franchisor has the burden (3065(e)(6))
3065(e)(4)	Post-Audit/Post- Appeal Final denial of warranty claim following an audit following franchisor's appeal process	Notification of the Final Denial to the franchisee.	Within 6 months after receipt of the written notice	Franchisor has the burden (3065(e)(6))

# **RETAIL LABOR RATE OR RETAIL PARTS RATE - Motor Vehicle Dealers**

# Establishment or Modification of Franchisee's Retail Labor Rate or Retail Parts Rate

A franchisee can establish or modify its retail labor rate or retail parts rate no more often than once per calendar year by submitting in writing to its franchisor whichever of the following is *fewer* in number:

- 100 sequential qualified repair orders, including any nonqualified repair orders in the same time period.<sup>16</sup>
- All repair orders completed during any 90-consecutive-day period.

(Veh. Code § 3065.2(a)(1)(A)-(B))

# How a Franchisee Calculates its Retail Labor Rate?

To calculate its *retail labor rate*, a franchisee shall determine the total charges for labor from the qualified repairs orders submitted as indicated above in Vehicle Code section 3065.2(a)(1)(A)-(B) and divide that amount by the total number of hours. (Veh. Code § 3065.2(a)(2))

#### How a Franchisee Calculates its Retail Parts Rate?

To calculate its *retail parts rate*, a franchisee shall determine the total charges for parts from the qualified repair orders submitted as indicated above in Vehicle Code section 3065.2(a)(1)(A)-(B) and divide that amount by the franchisee's total cost of the purchase of those parts, then subtract one, and multiply by 100 to produce a percentage. (Veh. Code § 3065.2(a)(3))

# Statutorily Required Notice to the Franchisor by the Franchisee of its Retail Labor Rate and Retail Parts Rate

The franchisee is statutorily required to provide its franchisor with *notice* of its retail labor rate and retail parts rate as calculated above. (Veh. Code § 3065.2(a)(4))

# How Repair Orders are Submitted Pursuant to Section 3065.2?

A franchisee may submit any of the following to its franchisor:<sup>17</sup>

1. For calculating both its retail labor rate and retail parts rate, a franchisee can submit

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> As used in Vehicle Code section 3065.2(a), a "qualified repair order" is defined as "a repair order, closed at the time of submission, for work that was performed outside of the period of the manufacturer's warranty and paid for by the customer, but that would have been covered by a manufacturer's warranty if the work had been required and performed during the period of the warranty." (Veh. Code § 3065.2(j)) Qualified repair orders submitted under Vehicle Code section 3065.2(a) shall be from a period occurring not more than 180 days before the submission. (Veh. Code § 3065.2(b))

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> For purposes of Vehicle Code section 3065.2, a franchisee may submit its repair orders electronically to its franchisor. (Veh. Code § 3065.2(b))

a single set of qualified repair orders; or

2. For calculating only its retail labor rate or only its retail parts rate, a franchisee can submit a set of qualified repair orders.

(Veh. Code § 3065.2(b)(1)-(2))

# What Types of Charges included in a Repair Order should be Omitted in Calculating a Franchisee's Retail Labor Rate and Retail Parts Rate?

In calculating its retail labor rate and retail parts rate, the franchisee shall omit any charges included in a repair order from the calculation that do not reflect the franchisee's retail customerpay labor and parts rates including, but not limited to, any of the following:

- 1. Manufacturer, manufacturer branch, distributor, or distributor branch special events, specials, or promotional discounts for retail customer repairs.
- 2. Parts sold, or repairs performed, at wholesale.
- 3. Routine maintenance, including, but not limited to, the replacement of bulbs, fluids, filters, batteries, and belts that are not provided in the course of, and related to, a repair.
- 4. Items that do not have individual part numbers including, but not limited to, nuts, bolts, and fasteners.
- 5. Vehicle reconditioning.
- 6. Accessories.
- 7. Repairs of conditions caused by a collision, a road hazard, the force of the elements, vandalism, theft, or owner, operational, or third-party negligence or deliberate act.
- 8. Parts sold or repairs performed for insurance carriers.
- 9. Vehicle emission inspections required by law.
- 10. Manufacturer-approved goodwill or policy repairs or replacements.
- 11. Repairs for government agencies or service contract providers.
- 12. Repairs with aftermarket parts, when calculating the retails parts rate, but not the retail labor rate.
- 13. Repairs with aftermarket parts.

- 14. Replacement of or work on tires, including front-end alignments and wheel or tire rotations.
- 15. Repairs of motor vehicles owned by the franchisee or an employee thereof at the time of the repair.

(Veh. Code § 3065.2(c)(1)-(15))

#### A Franchisor may Contest to the Franchisee the "Material Accuracy" of the Retail Labor Rate or Retail Parts Rate by Submitting a "Notification" to the Franchisee

A franchisor may contest to the franchisee the "material accuracy" of the retail labor rate or retail parts rate within 30 days after receiving the statutorily required notice from the franchisee discussed above or, if the franchisor requests supplemental repair orders pursuant to paragraph (4) of Vehicle Code section 3065.2(d), within 30 days after receiving the supplemental repair orders. (Veh. Code § 3065.2(d)(1))

If the franchisor seeks to contest the retail labor rate, retail parts rate, or both, it shall submit no more than one *notification* to the franchisee. (Veh. Code § 3065.2(d)(1))

The notification is limited to the assertion that the rate is "materially inaccurate" or fraudulent, and *shall* include the following:

- 1. A full explanation of any and all reasons for the allegation;
- 2. Evidence substantiating the franchisor's position;
- 3. A copy of all calculations used by the franchisor in determining the franchisor's position; and,
- 4. A proposed *adjusted retail labor rate or retail parts rate*, as applicable, on the basis of the repair orders submitted by the franchisee, or if applicable, on the basis of supplemental repair orders submitted pursuant to Vehicle Code section 3065.2(d)(5).

After submitting the notification, the franchisor shall not add to, expand, supplement, or otherwise modify any element of that notification, including, but not limited to, its grounds for contesting the retail parts rate, retail labor rate, or both under Vehicle Code section 3065.2(a). (Veh. Code § 3065.2(d)(1))

# <u>The Franchisor's Proposed Adjusted Retail Labor Rate or Retail Parts Rate is Effective if</u> <u>the Franchisee Agrees</u>

If the franchisee agrees with the conclusions of its franchisor and any corresponding adjustment to the retail labor rate or retail parts rate then no further action is required. The new adjusted rate is effective as of the 30<sup>th</sup> calendar day after the franchisor's receipt of the notice submitted

pursuant to Vehicle Code section 3065.2(a). (Veh. Code § 3065.2(d)(2))

# If the Franchisee does not Agree with the Proposed Adjusted Rate then a Protest can be Filed with the Board

In the event the franchisor provides all of the information required in its notification as indicated above, and the franchisee does not agree with the adjusted rate proposed by the franchisor, the franchisor shall pay the franchisee at the franchisor's proposed adjusted retail labor rate or retail parts rate until the Board issues a decision on a protest filed pursuant to Vehicle Code section 3065.4, or until any mutual resolution between the franchisor and the franchisee.

The franchisor's proposed adjusted rate shall be deemed to be effective as of the 30<sup>th</sup> day after the franchisor's receipt of the notice submitted pursuant to Vehicle Code section 3065.2(a). (Veh. Code § 3065.2(d)(3))

# If the Franchisor Determines that the Franchisee's Retail Labor Rate or Retail Parts Rate is "Substantially Higher" than the Franchisee's Current Warranty Rate, the Franchisor can Request Supplemental Repair Orders

Based on the franchisee's set of repair orders submitted, if the franchisor determines that the franchisee's submission for a retail labor rate or retail parts rate is substantially higher than the franchisee's current warranty rate, the franchisor may request, in writing, all repair orders closed within the period of 30 days immediately preceding, or 30 days immediately following, the set of repair orders submitted by the franchisee. The written request should be made within 30 days after the franchisor's receipt of the notice submitted pursuant to Vehicle Code section 3065.2(a). (Veh. Code § 3065.2(d)(4))

If the franchisee fails to provide the *supplemental repair orders*, all time periods under this section shall be suspended until the supplemental repair orders are provided. (Veh. Code § 3065.2(d)(4))

If the franchisor requests supplemental repair orders, the franchisor may calculate a **proposed adjusted retail labor rate or retail parts rate**, as applicable, based upon any set of the qualified repair orders submitted by the franchisee, if the franchisor complies with the requirements outlined in Vehicle Code section 3065.2(d)(5)(A)-(C)

# What if the Franchisor does not Contest the Retail Labor Rate or Retail Parts Rate?

If the franchisor does not contest the retail labor rate or retail parts rate, or if the franchisor fails to timely contest the rate submitted by the franchisee, the uncontested retail labor rate or retail parts rate takes effect on the 30<sup>th</sup> day after the franchisor's receipt of the notice.

The franchisor shall use the new retail labor rate or retail parts rate, or both, if applicable, to determine compensation to fulfill warranty obligations by the franchisee. (Veh. Code § 3065.2(e))

# Considerations in Calculating the Retail Labor Rate and Retail Parts Rate

When calculating the retail parts rate and retail labor rate, all of the following shall apply:

- 1. Promotional reward program cash-equivalent pay methods shall not be considered discounts.
- 2. The franchisor is prohibited from establishing or implementing a special part or component number for parts used in warranty work, if the result of the special part or component lowers compensation to the franchisee below that amount calculated pursuant to this section.

This paragraph does not apply to parts or components that are subject to a recall and are issued a new special part or component number.

This paragraph does not prohibit a franchisor from changing prices of parts in the ordinary course of business.

(Veh. Code § 3065.2(f)(1)-(2)(A)-(B))

### <u>Considerations when the Franchisor is Compensating the Franchisee for the Retail Parts</u> <u>Rate</u>

When the franchisor is compensating the franchisee for the *retail parts rate*, all of the following shall apply:

- 1. If the franchisor furnishes a part to a franchisee at no cost for use in performing warranty obligations, the franchisor shall compensate the franchisee the amount resulting from multiplying the wholesale value of the part by the franchisee's retail parts rate determined pursuant to Vehicle Code section 3065.2.
- 2. If the franchisor furnishes a part to a franchisee at a reduced cost for use in performing warranty obligations, the franchisor shall compensate the franchisee the amount resulting from multiplying the wholesale value of the part by the franchisee's retail parts rate determined pursuant Vehicle Code section 3065.2, plus the franchisee's cost of the part.
- 3. The *wholesale value of the part*, for purposes of Vehicle Code section 3065.2(g), shall be the greater of:
  - A. The amount the franchisee paid for the part or a substantially identical part if already owned by the franchisee.
  - B. The cost of the part shown in a current franchisor's established price schedule.

C. The cost of a substantially identical part shown in a current franchisor's established price schedule.

(Veh. Code § 3065.2(g)(1)-(3)(A)-(C))

# <u>The Method for Establishing or Modifying a Franchisee's Retail Labor Rate, Retail Parts</u> <u>Rate, or Both</u>

A franchisee's retail labor rate, retail parts rate, or both shall be calculated only using the method prescribed in Vehicle Code section 3065.2.

A franchisor shall not use or require a franchisee to use any other method including, but not limited to, any of the following:

- 1. Substituting any other "purported repair sample" for that submitted by a franchisee.
- 2. Imposing any method related to the establishment of a retail labor rate or retail parts rate that is unreasonable or time consuming, or require the use of information that is unreasonable or time consuming to obtain, including part-by-part or transaction-by-transaction calculations or utilization of the franchisee's financial statement.
- 3. Unilaterally calculating a retail labor rate or retail parts rate for a franchisee, except as provided in Vehicle Code section 3065.2(d).
- 4. Using a franchisee's sample, submitted for establishing or increasing its retail parts rate, to establish or reduce the franchisee's retail labor rate or using a franchisee's sample, submitted for establishing or increasing its retail labor rate, to establish or reduce the franchisee's retail parts rate.

(Veh. Code § 3065.2(h)(1)-(4))

# What Actions Franchisors are Precluded from Undertaking?

Subdivision (i) of Vehicle Code section 3065.2 precludes a franchisor from:

- 1. Attempting to influence a franchisee to implement or change the prices for which the franchisee sells parts or labor in retail repairs because the franchisor is seeking compensation or exercising any right pursuant to this section.
- 2. Directly or indirectly, taking or threatening to take any adverse action against a franchisee for seeking compensation or exercising any right pursuant to Vehicle Code section 3065.2, by any action including, but not limited to, the following:
  - A. Assessing penalties, surcharges, or similar costs to a franchisee.
  - B. Transferring or shifting any costs to a franchisee.

- C. Limiting allocation of vehicles or parts to a franchisee.
- D. Acting or failing to act other than in good faith.
- E. Hindering, delaying, or rejecting the proper and timely payment of compensation due under Vehicle Code section 3065.2 to a franchisee.
- F. Establishing, implementing, enforcing, or applying any discriminatory policy, standard, rule, program, or incentive regarding compensation due under Vehicle Code section 3065.2.
- G. Conducting or threatening to conduct nonroutine or nonrandom warranty, nonwarranty repair, or other service-related audits in response to seeking compensation or exercising any right pursuant to Vehicle Code section 3065.2.

# (Veh. Code § 3065.2(i)(1)-(2)(A)-(G)

Subdivision (i) does not prohibit a franchisor from increasing prices of vehicles or parts in the ordinary course of business. (Veh. Code § 3065.2(i)(3))

#### <u>Protest for Franchisor's Failure to Comply with Section 3065.2 or if Franchisee Disputes</u> the Franchisor's Proposed Adjusted Retail Labor Rate or Retail Parts Rate

If a franchisor *fails to comply* with Vehicle Code section 3065.2, or if a franchisee disputes the franchisor's *proposed adjusted retail labor rate or retail parts rate*, the franchisee may file a protest with the Board for a declaration of the franchisee's retail labor rate or retail parts rate.

If there is a hearing, the franchisor has the burden of proof that it complied with Vehicle Code section 3065.2 and that the franchisee's determination of the retail labor rate or retail parts rate is materially inaccurate or fraudulent. (Veh. Code § 3065.4(a))

#### Time for Filing a Protest

Protests pertaining to compliance with Section 3065.2 or franchisee disputes of the franchisor's proposed adjusted retail labor rate or retail parts rate are not subject to any specific statutory time limitations for filing. However, failure to file a protest within a reasonable time could result in a dealer losing the right to a hearing before the Board.

# Required Elements of Protest

The required content of a protest under Vehicle Code section 3065.4 is described in 13 CCR § 586. A protest involving retail labor rate or retail parts rate must contain all of the following (see Appendix for sample Form A):

Content Requirements	Regulatory Authority
Must be in writing and be signed by a franchisee or its	13 CCR § 583
attorney. <sup>18</sup>	
Must set forth in clear and concise language the factual	13 CCR § 586(a)(1)
contentions of the franchisee with respect to the protest.	
Must set forth the franchisee's mailing address and	13 CCR § 586(a)(3)
telephone number, and the name, mailing address and	
telephone number of its attorney or authorized agent, if any.	
All correspondence and notices to the franchisee shall	
thereafter be addressed to said address, if the dealer	
principal is presenting its own case, or to the address of the	
dealer's attorney or agent, if so represented.	
Shall indicate either that the franchisee does or does not	13 CCR § 586(a)(4)
desire to appear before the Board.	
Franchisee may submit, as exhibits to the protest,	13 CCR § 586(a)(2)
photographic, documentary, or similar physical evidence	
relevant to the matter with an appropriate description in the	
protest.	
Franchisee shall simultaneously deliver a \$200 filing fee in	13 CCR § 553.40
the form of a check or money order payable to the New	
Motor Vehicle Board, or a request for a fee waiver.	
Franchisee shall serve a copy of the protest on the franchisor	13 CCR § 584
and proof of service shall accompany the protest submitted	13 CCR § 551.24
to the Board.	

# **Determination of Protest**

In a decision, the Board may determine the difference between the amount the franchisee has actually received from the franchisor for fulfilled warranty obligations and the amount that the franchisee would have received if the franchisor had compensated the franchisee at the retail labor rate and retail parts rate as determined in accordance with Vehicle Code section 3065.2 for a period beginning 30 days after receipt of the franchisee's initial submission under Vehicle Code section 3065.2(a). (Veh. Code § 3065.4(b))

The franchisee may submit a request to the franchisor to calculate the unpaid warranty reimbursement compensation and the franchisor shall provide this calculation to the franchisee within 30 days after receipt of the request. The request for the calculation will also be deemed a request for payment of the unpaid warranty reimbursement compensation. (Veh. Code §

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> See footnote 7.

3065.4(b))

If the franchisor fails to make full payment within 30 days after the franchisee submits a request for payment, the franchisee may file an action in superior court for injunctive and other relief to enforce the determination or order of the Board. The franchisee may also recover in superior court its actual expenses in bringing and maintaining an enforcement action. (Veh. Code § 3065.4(c))

Either the franchisor or the franchisee may seek judicial review of the Board's determination pursuant to Vehicle Code section 3068. (Veh. Code § 3065.4(d))

# RETAIL LABOR RATE OR RETAIL PARTS RATE PROTESTS Motor Vehicle Dealers

Vehicle Code Section	Type of Protest	Notice	Time to File Protest	Burden of Proof if there is a Hearing
3065.4(a)	Franchisee contends its franchisor failed to comply with Section 3065.2 pertaining to the establishment or modification of the franchisee's retail labor rate, retail parts rate, or both	Franchisee provides notice to the franchisor of its retail labor rate and retail parts rate calculated in accordance with Section 3065.2(a)	None specified	Franchisor has the burden of proof that it complied with Section 3065.2 (3065.4(a))
3065.4(a)	Franchisee disputes the franchisor's proposed adjusted retail labor rate or retail parts rate	Franchisor may contest to the franchisee the material accuracy of the retail labor rate or retail parts rate that was calculated by the franchisee under Section 3065.2(d) within 30 days after receiving notice from the franchisee or, if the franchisor requests supplemental repair orders pursuant to Section 3065.2(d)(4), within 30 days after receiving the supplemental repair orders (3065.2(d)(1))	None specified	Franchisor has the burden of proof that the franchisee's determination of the retail labor rate or retail parts rate is "materially inaccurate or fraudulent" (3065.4(a))

### WARRANTY CLAIMS - RV Dealers

#### Statutory Authority

Vehicle Code section 3075 requires every new recreational vehicle manufacturer or distributor to properly fulfill every warranty agreement made by it and adequately and fairly compensate its dealers for labor and parts used to perform warranty repairs and service.

#### Franchisor's Notice of Compensation for Warranty Reimbursement

The manufacturers and distributors are required to file copies of their warranty reimbursement schedules or formulas with the Board. The schedule or formula must be reasonable with respect to the time and compensation allowed for the performance of warranty work.

#### **Approval of Warranty Claims**

Vehicle Code section 3075(d) also requires that warranty claims be approved or disapproved within 30 days after their receipt by the franchisor. Any claim not specifically disapproved in writing within 30 days from receipt by the franchisor shall be deemed approved on the 30<sup>th</sup> day.

Approved warranty claims must be paid within 30 days of approval. However, Vehicle Code section 3075(d) states: "Failure to approve or pay within the above specified time limits, in individual instances for reasons beyond the reasonable control of the franchisor, do not constitute a violation of this article [Article 5 RV protests]."

#### **Disapproval of Warranty Claims**

Vehicle Code section 3075(c) requires that the franchisor that disallows a franchisee's warranty claim for a defective part on the basis that the part was not defective must return such part to the dealer at the franchisor's expense, or reimburse the dealer for the part, at the franchisor's option.

The dealer is also entitled to written notice of disapproval within 30 days after the warranty claims are received by the franchisor. The notice must contain the specific grounds for disapproval (Veh. Code § 3075(d)).

#### Audits of Franchisee Warranty Records

Audits of franchisee warranty records may be conducted by the franchisor on a reasonable basis, and for a period of 12 months after a claim is paid or a credit issued. Any chargeback to a franchisee for warranty parts or service compensation shall be made within 90 days of the completion of the audit. However, if a false claim was submitted by a franchisee with the intent to defraud the franchisor, a longer period for an audit and any resulting chargeback may be permitted if the franchisor obtains an order from the Board. (Veh. Code § 3075(e))

# Time for Filing a Protest

Protests involving warranty disputes are not subject to any specific statutory time limitations for filing. However, failure to file a protest within a reasonable time could result in a dealer losing the right to a hearing before the Board.

#### **Required Elements of Protest**

The required content of a protest under Vehicle Code section 3075 is described in 13 CCR § 586. A protest involving warranty claims must contain all of the following (see Appendix for sample Form A):

Content Requirements	Regulatory Authority
Must be in writing and be signed by a franchisee or its attorney. <sup>19</sup>	13 CCR § 583
Must set forth in clear and concise language the factual contentions of the franchisee with respect to the protest.	13 CCR § 586(a)(1)
Must set forth the franchisee's mailing address and telephone number, and the name, mailing address and telephone number of its attorney or authorized agent, if any. All correspondence and notices to the franchisee shall thereafter be addressed to said address, if the dealer principal is presenting its own case, or to the address of the dealer's attorney or agent, if so represented.	13 CCR § 586(a)(3)
Shall state either that the franchisee does or does not desire to appear before the Board.	13 CCR § 586(a)(4)
Franchisee may submit, as exhibits to the protest, photographic, documentary, or similar physical evidence relevant to the matter with an appropriate description in the protest.	13 CCR § 586(a)(2)
Franchisee shall simultaneously deliver a \$200 filing fee in the form of a check or money order payable to the New Motor Vehicle Board, or a request for a fee waiver.	13 CCR § 553.40
Franchisee shall serve a copy of the protest on the franchisor and proof of service shall accompany the protest submitted to the Board.	13 CCR § 584 13 CCR § 551.24

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> See footnote 7.

#### Good Cause

Franchisee claims for warranty compensation shall not be disapproved except for good cause such as performance of non-warranty repairs, lack of material documentation, or fraud. (Veh. Code § 3075(e))

#### **Determination of Protest**

If a protest is filed, the Board shall determine whether the schedule or formula is reasonable, taking into account the dealer's labor rate to its retail customers. If there is a hearing, the franchisee has the burden of proving that the warranty reimbursement schedule is not reasonable, but the franchisor has the burden of proof to establish that a franchisee acted with intent to defraud the franchisor when the issue is material (Veh. Code § 3080(c)).

# FRANCHISOR INCENTIVE PROGRAM CLAIMS - Motor Vehicle Dealers

# Statutory Authority

Pursuant to Vehicle Code section 3065.1, all claims made by a new motor vehicle franchisee for payment under the terms of a franchisor incentive program shall be approved or disapproved within 30 days after receipt by the franchisor.

#### Franchisor's Notice of Denial of Franchisor Incentive Program Reimbursement

Vehicle Code section 3065.1(a) requires that a franchisor who denies payment under the terms of a franchisor incentive program shall notify the franchisee within 30 days after receipt by the franchisor and provide specific grounds on which the disapproval was based.

#### Approval/Disapproval of Franchisor Incentive Program Reimbursement

Any claim not specifically disapproved in writing within 30 days from receipt shall be deemed approved on the 30<sup>th</sup> day. If incentive program compensation claims are approved, they must be paid within 30 days of approval. However, Vehicle Code section 3065.1(f) provides that the failure to approve or pay within the above specified time limits, in individual instances for reasons beyond the reasonable control of the franchisor, do not constitute a violation of Article 4 (pertains to motor vehicles other than RVs).

#### **Disapproval of Franchisor Incentive Program Claims**

A franchisor shall not disapprove a claim unless the claim meets one of the following categories:

- 1. False;
- 2. Fraudulent;
- 3. The claim is ineligible under the terms of the incentive program as previously communicated to the franchisee; or
- 4. Material noncompliance with documentation and administrative claims submission requirements if the requirements are reasonable and nondiscriminatory. (Veh. Code § 3065.1(b))

#### Protest of Initial Disapproval of Franchisor Incentive Program Claims

A franchisee can file a protest of the initial disapproval of a franchisor incentive program claim within 6 months after receipt of the written notice. If there is a hearing, the franchisor has the burden of proof. (Veh. Code § 3065.1(e))

### Franchisor Provided "Reasonable" Appeal Process

Vehicle Code section 3065.1(c) requires franchisors to provide a reasonable appeal process that allows the franchisee at least 30 days after receipt of the written disapproval notice to provide additional supporting documentation or information rebutting the disapproval.

If the disapproval is based upon noncompliance with documentation or administrative claims submission requirements, the franchisor shall allow the franchisee at least 30 days from the date of receipt of the disapproval notice to cure any material noncompliance.

If the disapproval is rebutted, and material noncompliance is cured before the applicable deadline, the franchisor shall approve the claim.

There are potentially two 30-day time periods: (1) reasonable appeal; and (2) opportunity to cure.

# Final Denial of Franchisor Incentive Program Claim

If the franchisee provides additional supporting documentation or information purporting to rebut the disapproval, attempts to cure noncompliance relating to the claim, or otherwise appeals denial of the claim and the franchisor continues to deny the claim, the franchisor shall provide the franchisee with a written notification of the final denial within 30 days of completion of the appeal process, which shall conspicuously state "Final Denial" on the first page. (Veh. Code § 3065.1(d))

# Protest of Final Denial of Franchisor Incentive Program Claim following a Franchisor's Appeal Process

A franchisee can file a protest of the final denial of a franchisor incentive program claim following a franchisor's appeal process within 6 months after receipt of the written notice. If there is a hearing, the franchisor has the burden of proof. (Veh. Code § 3065.1(e))

#### Audits of Franchisee Incentive Program Records

Audits of franchisee incentive program records may be conducted by the franchisor on a reasonable basis, and for a period of 9 months after a claim is paid or a credit issued.

A franchisor shall not select a franchisee for an audit, or perform an audit, in a punitive, retaliatory, or unfairly discriminatory manner.

A franchisor may conduct no more than one random audit of a franchisee in a 9-month period.

The franchisor's notification to the franchisee of any additional audit within a 9-month period shall be accompanied by written disclosure of the basis for that additional audit. (Veh. Code 3065.1(g)(1))

# **Disapproval of Previously Approved Franchisor Incentive Program Claims**

Previously approved claims shall not be disapproved or charged back to the dealer unless the claim meets one of the following categories:

- 1. False;
- 2. Fraudulent;
- 3. The claim is ineligible under the terms of the incentive program as previously communicated to the franchisee; or
- 4. Material noncompliance with documentation and administrative claims submission requirements if the requirements are reasonable and nondiscriminatory.

These are the same categories for initial disapproval of a franchisor incentive program claim. (Veh. Code § 3065.1(g)(2))

A franchisor shall not disapprove or chargeback a claim based upon an extrapolation from a sample of claims, unless the sample of claims is selected randomly, and the extrapolation is performed in a reasonable and statistically valid manner.

If the franchisor disapproves of a previously approved claim following an audit, within 30 days after the audit, the franchisor shall provide to the franchisee a written disapproval notice stating the specific grounds upon which the claim is disapproved. (Veh. Code § 3065.1(g)(3))

# Protest of Franchisor Incentive Program Claim Disapproval of a Previously Approved Claim Following an Audit

A franchisee can file a protest of the franchisor incentive program claim disapproval of a previously approved claim following an audit within 6 months after receipt of the written notice. If there is a hearing, the franchisor has the burden of proof. (Veh. Code § 3065.1(g)(6))

# Franchisor Provided "Reasonable" Appeal Process

Vehicle Code section 3065.1(g)(3) requires franchisors to provide a reasonable appeal process that allows the franchisee a reasonable period of not less than 30 days after receipt of the written disapproval notice to respond to any disapproval with additional supporting documentation or information rebutting the disapproval and to cure any material noncompliance, with the period commensurate with the volume of claims under consideration.

If the franchisee rebuts any disapproval and cures any material noncompliance relating to a claim before the applicable deadline, the franchisor shall not chargeback the franchisee for that claim.

# Final Denial of Franchisor Incentive Program Claim Following an Audit

If the franchisee provides additional supporting documentation or information purporting to rebut the disapproval, attempts to cure noncompliance relating to the claim, or otherwise appeals denial of the claim and the franchisor continues to deny the claim, the franchisor shall provide the franchisee with a written notification of the final denial within 30 days of completion of the appeal process, which shall conspicuously state "Final Denial" on the first page. (Veh. Code § 3065.1(g)(4))

#### <u>Protest of Final Denial of Franchisor Incentive Program Claim Following an Audit Following</u> <u>the Franchisor's Appeal Process</u>

A franchisee can file a protest of the final denial of a franchisor incentive program claim following an audit following the franchisor's appeal process within 6 months after receipt of the written notice. If there is a hearing, the franchisor has the burden of proof. (Veh. Code § 3065.1(g)(6))

#### Franchisor Chargeback for Franchisor Incentive Program Claims

Vehicle Code section 3065.1(g)(5) provides that the franchisor shall not chargeback the franchisee until 45 days after receipt of the written disapproval of a previously approved claim following an audit or final denial of a franchisor incentive program claim following an audit following the franchisor's appeal process, whichever is later.

If the franchisee cures any material noncompliance relating to a claim, the franchisor shall not chargeback the dealer for that claim.

Any chargeback to a franchisee for incentive program compensation shall be made within 90 days of receipt of that written notice.

If the Board sustains the chargeback or the protest is dismissed, the franchisor shall have 90 days following issuance of the final order or the dismissal to make the chargeback, unless otherwise provided in a settlement agreement.

If the franchisee files a protest pursuant to this subdivision prior to the franchisor's chargeback for denied claims, the franchisor shall not offset or otherwise undertake to collect the chargeback until the Board issues a final order on the protest. (Veh. Code § 3065.1(g)(6))

In summary, days 45-90 are the only days to chargeback a dealer for franchisor incentive program claims. A manufacturer or distributor cannot chargeback a dealer before day 44, or after day 91. But if a protest is filed prior to a chargeback, then the franchisor cannot chargeback the dealer during the above time period. It must wait until the Board decides the protest and if the protest is dismissed or the Board sustains the chargeback, then the franchisor can chargeback the dealer but must do so within 90 days after the Board action (or within time period allowed by settlement agreement, if any).

However, if a false claim was submitted by a franchisee with the intent to defraud the franchisor, a longer period for an audit and any resulting chargeback may be permitted if the franchisor

obtains an order from the Board. (Veh. Code § 3065.1(h))

# **Required Elements of Protest**

The required content of a protest under Vehicle Code section 3065.1 is described in 13 CCR § 586. A protest involving franchisor incentive program claims must contain all of the following (see Appendix for sample Form A):

Content Requirements	Regulatory Authority
Must be in writing and be signed by a franchisee or its attorney. <sup>20</sup>	13 CCR § 583
Must set forth in clear and concise language the factual contentions of the franchisee with respect to the protest.	13 CCR § 586(a)(1)
Must set forth the franchisee's mailing address and telephone number, and the name, mailing address and telephone number of its attorney or authorized agent, if any. All correspondence and notices to the franchisee shall thereafter be addressed to said address, if the dealer principal is presenting its own case, or to the address of the dealer's attorney or agent, if so represented.	13 CCR § 586(a)(3)
Shall state either that the franchisee does or does not desire to appear before the Board.	13 CCR § 586(a)(4)
Franchisee may submit, as exhibits to the protest, photographic, documentary, or similar physical evidence relevant to the matter with an appropriate description in the protest.	13 CCR § 586(a)(2)
Franchisee shall simultaneously deliver a \$200 filing fee in the form of a check or money order payable to the New Motor Vehicle Board, or a request for a fee waiver.	13 CCR § 553.40
Franchisee shall serve a copy of the protest on the franchisor and proof of service shall accompany the protest submitted to the Board.	13 CCR § 584 13 CCR § 551.24

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> See footnote 7.

# FRANCHISOR INCENTIVE PROGRAM PROTESTS Motor Vehicle Dealers

Vehicle Code Section	Type of Protest	Notice to Dealer	Time to File Protest	Burden of Proof if there is a Hearing
3065.1(a)	Initial Disapproval Initial disapproval of franchisor incentive program claims	Franchisor provides a written notice of disapproval within 30 days after the franchisor's receipt of a claim submitted by a franchisee.	6 months from receipt of the written notice	Franchisor has the burden (3065.1(e))
3065.1(d)	Final Denial/ Post-Appeal Final denial of franchisor incentive program claim following a franchisor's appeal process	Written notice of Final Denial to the franchisee.	6 months from receipt of the written notice	Franchisor has the burden (3065.1(e))
3065.1(g)(3)	<b>Post-Audit</b> Franchisor incentive program claim disapproval of a previously approved claim following an audit	Franchisor provides a written notice of disapproval within 30 days after the audit stating the specific grounds.	6 months after receipt of the written notice	Franchisor has the burden (3065.1(g)(6))
3065.1(g)(4)	<b>Post-Audit/Post-</b> <b>Appeal/Final Denial</b> Final denial of a franchisor incentive program claim following an audit following the franchisor's appeal process	Written notification of the Final Denial.	6 months after receipt of the written notice	Franchisor has the burden (3065.1(g)(6))

# FRANCHISOR INCENTIVE PROGRAM CLAIMS - RV Dealers

### **Statutory Authority**

Pursuant to Vehicle Code section 3076, all claims made by a recreational vehicle franchisee for payment under the terms of a franchisor incentive program shall be approved or disapproved within 30 days after receipt by the franchisor.

#### Franchisor's Notice of Denial of Franchisor Incentive Program Reimbursement

Vehicle Code section 3076(a) requires that a franchisor who denies payment under the terms of a franchisor incentive program, shall notify the franchisee within 30 days and provide specific grounds on which the disapproval was based.

#### Approval/Disapproval of Franchisor Incentive Program Reimbursement

Any claim not specifically disapproved in writing within 30 days from receipt shall be deemed approved on the 30<sup>th</sup> day. If incentive program compensation claims are approved, they must be paid within 30 days of approval. However, Vehicle Code section 3076(a) provides that the failure to approve or pay within the above specified time limits, in individual instances for reasons beyond the reasonable control of the franchisor, do not constitute a violation of Article 5, pertaining to RVs.

#### Audits of Franchisee Incentive Program Records

Vehicle Code section 3076(b) provides for audits of franchisee incentive program records if reasonable and for a period of 18 months after a claim is paid or a credit issued. Any chargeback to a franchisee for incentive program compensation shall be made within 90 days of completion of the audit. However, if a false claim was submitted by the franchisee with the intent to defraud the franchisor, a longer period for the audit and any resulting chargeback may be permitted if the franchisor obtains an order to that effect from the Board.

# Time for Filing a Protest

Following the disapproval of a claim, a franchisee shall have one year from receipt of the notice of disapproval in which to appeal and file a protest with the Board.

# **Required Elements of Protest**

The required content of a protest under Vehicle Code section 3076 is described in 13 CCR § 586. A protest involving franchisor incentive program claims must contain all of the following (see Appendix for sample Form A):

Content Requirements	Regulatory Authority
Must be in writing and be signed by a franchisee or its attorney. <sup>21</sup>	13 CCR § 583
Must set forth in clear and concise language the factual contentions of the franchisee with respect to the protest.	13 CCR § 586(a)(1)
Must set forth the franchisee's mailing address and telephone number, and the name, mailing address and telephone number of its attorney or authorized agent, if any. All correspondence and notices to the franchisee shall thereafter be addressed to said address, if the dealer principal is presenting its own case, or to the address of the dealer's attorney or agent, if so represented.	13 CCR § 586(a)(3)
Shall indicate either that the franchisee does or does not desire to appear before the Board.	13 CCR § 586(a)(4)
Franchisee may submit, as exhibits to the protest, photographic, documentary, or similar physical evidence relevant to the matter with an appropriate description in the protest.	13 CCR § 586(a)(2)
Franchisee shall simultaneously deliver a \$200 filing fee in the form of a check or money order payable to the New Motor Vehicle Board, or a request for a fee waiver.	13 CCR § 553.40
Franchisee shall serve a copy of the protest on the franchisor and proof of service shall accompany the protest submitted to the Board.	13 CCR § 584 13 CCR § 551.24

# Good Cause

Franchisee claims for incentive program compensation shall not be disapproved except for good cause, such as ineligibility under the terms of the incentive program, lack of material documentation, or fraud. (Veh. Code § 3076(b))

# **Determination of Protest**

The franchisee has the burden of proof, but the franchisor has the burden of proof to establish that a franchisee acted with intent to defraud the franchisor when the issue is material (Veh. Code § 3080(c)).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> See footnote 7.

#### LIMITATIONS ON CERTAIN FRANCHISOR ACTIONS INCONSISTENT WITH EXISTING STANDARDS - Motor Vehicle Dealers

#### a. <u>Franchisor Performance Standards, Sales Objectives, or Programs for Measuring a</u> <u>Dealer's Sales, Service, or Customer Service Performance (Veh. Code § 3065.3(a))</u>

Vehicle Code section 3065.3(a) provides that "[n]o franchisor shall establish or maintain a performance standard, sales objective, or program for measuring a dealer's sales, service, or customer service performance that is inconsistent with the standards set forth in subdivision (g) of Section 11713.13."

Subdivision (g) of Vehicle Code section 11713.13 provides that:

It is unlawful and a violation of this code for any manufacturer, manufacturer branch, distributor, or distributor branch licensed under this code to do, directly or indirectly through an affiliate, any of the following:

(g) (1) Establish or maintain a performance standard, sales objective, or program for measuring a dealer's sales, service, or customer service performance that may materially affect the dealer, including, but not limited to, the dealer's right to payment under any incentive or reimbursement program or establishment of working capital requirements, unless both of the following requirements are satisfied:

(A) The performance standard, sales objective, or program for measuring dealership sales, service, or customer service performance is reasonable in light of all existing circumstances, including, but not limited to, the following:

(i) Demographics in the dealer's area of responsibility.

(ii) Geographical and market characteristics in the dealer's area of responsibility.

(iii) The availability and allocation of vehicles and parts inventory.

(iv) Local and statewide economic circumstances.

(v) Historical sales, service, and customer service performance of the line-make within the dealer's area of responsibility, including vehicle brand preferences of consumers in the dealer's area of responsibility.

(B) Within 30 days after a request by the dealer, the manufacturer, manufacturer branch, distributor, distributor branch, or affiliate provides a written summary of the methodology and data used in establishing the performance standard, sales objective, or program for measuring dealership sales or service performance. The summary shall be in detail sufficient to permit the dealer to determine how the standard was established and applied to the dealer.

• • •

. . .

#### b. Franchisor Allocation of Vehicles or Parts (Veh. Code § 3065.3(b))

Vehicle Code section 3065.3(b) provides that "[n]o franchisor shall allocate vehicles or parts in a manner inconsistent with the standards set forth in subdivision (a) of Section 11713.3."

Subdivision (a) of Vehicle Code section 11713.3 provides that:

It is unlawful and a violation of this code for any manufacturer, manufacturer branch, distributor, or distributor branch licensed under this code to do, directly or indirectly through an affiliate, any of the following:

(a)(1) To refuse or fail to deliver in reasonable quantities and within a reasonable time after receipt of an order from a dealer having a franchise for the retail sale of a new vehicle sold or distributed by the manufacturer or distributor, a new vehicle or parts or accessories to new vehicles that are of a model offered by the manufacturer or distributor to other franchisees in this state of the same line-make, if the vehicle, parts, or accessories are publicly advertised as being available for delivery or actually being delivered in this state. This subdivision is not violated, however, if the failure is caused by acts or causes beyond the control of the manufacturer, manufacturer branch, distributor, or distributor branch.

(2) To fail to disclose to any franchisee, upon written request, the basis upon which new motor vehicles of the same line-make are allocated or distributed to franchisees in the state and the basis upon which the current allocation or distribution is being made or will be made to the franchisee.

. . .

#### c. Franchisor's Imposition of a Facility or Equipment Policy (Veh. Code § 3065.3(c))

Vehicle Code section 3065.3(c) provides that "[n]o franchisor shall impose a facility or equipment policy inconsistent with the standards set forth in subdivision (a), (b), (c), or (k) of Section 11713.13.

Vehicle Code section 11713.13 provides, in part, as follows:

It is unlawful and a violation of this code for any manufacturer, manufacturer branch, distributor, or distributor branch licensed under this code to do, directly or indirectly through an affiliate, any of the following:

(a) Prevent, or attempt to prevent, by contract or otherwise, a dealer from acquiring, adding, or maintaining a sales or service operation for another line-make of motor vehicles at the same or expanded facility at which the dealer currently operates a dealership if the dealer complies with any reasonable facilities and capital requirements of the manufacturer or distributor.

(b) Require a dealer to establish or maintain exclusive facilities, personnel, or display space if the imposition of the requirement would be unreasonable in light of all existing circumstances, including economic conditions. . . .

(c) Require, by contract or otherwise, a dealer to make a material alteration, expansion, or addition to any dealership facility, unless the required alteration, expansion, or addition is reasonable in light of all existing circumstances, including economic conditions and advancements in vehicular technology....

. . .

(k) (1) Implement a program or policy that coerces or requires the franchisee to install direct current fast charging stations, unless all of the following are satisfied: . . .

# Time for Filing a Protest

There is no specific statutory time period in the Vehicle Code within which to file a Vehicle Code section 3065.3 protest. Failure to file a protest within a reasonable time, however, could result in a dealer losing the right to a hearing by the Board.

# **Required Elements of Protest**

The required content of a protest under Vehicle Code section 3065.3 is described in 13 CCR § 586.5. A protest must contain all of the following (see Appendix for sample Form A):

Content Requirements	Regulatory Authority
Must be in writing and be signed by a franchisee or its attorney. <sup>22</sup>	13 CCR § 583
Must set forth in clear and concise language the factual contentions of the franchisee with respect to the protest.	13 CCR § 586.5(a)(1)
Must set forth the franchisee's mailing address and telephone number, and the name, mailing address and telephone number of its attorney or authorized agent, if any. All correspondence and notices to the franchisee shall thereafter be addressed to said address, if the dealer principal is presenting its own case, or to the address of the dealer's attorney or agent, if so represented.	13 CCR § 586.5(a)(3)
Shall indicate either that the franchisee does or does not desire to appear before the Board.	13 CCR § 586.5(a)(4)
Franchisee may submit, as exhibits to the protest, photographic, documentary, or similar physical evidence relevant to the matter with an appropriate description in the protest.	13 CCR § 586.5(a)(2)
Franchisee shall simultaneously deliver a \$200 filing fee in the form of a check or money order payable to the New Motor Vehicle Board, or a request for a fee waiver.	13 CCR § 553.40
Franchisee shall serve a copy of the protest on the franchisor and proof of service shall accompany the protest submitted to the Board.	13 CCR § 584 13 CCR § 551.24

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> See footnote 7.

# **Determination of Protest**

If there is a hearing.	the franchisor ha	as the burden of	proof as follows: (	(Veh. Code § 3065.3(e)).
n anoro io a noaring,			proor ao ronomo. (	

Vehicle Code	Type of Protest	Burden of Proof
3065.3(a)	Performance Standard	The franchisor has the burden of proof that it complied with Section 3065.3; i.e., its "performance standard, sales objective, or program for measuring a dealer's sales, service, or customer service performance" is not inconsistent with the standards set forth in subdivision (g) of Vehicle Code section 11713.13.
3065.3(b)	Allocation of Vehicles or Parts	The franchisor has the burden of proof that it complied with Section 3065.3; i.e., its allocation of vehicles or parts is not inconsistent with the standards set forth in subdivision (a) of Vehicle Code section 11713.3.
3065.3(c)	Imposition of Facility or Equipment Policy	The franchisor has the burden of proof that it complied with Section 3065.3; i.e., imposition of its facility or equipment policy is not inconsistent with the standards set forth in subdivisions (a), (b), (c), or (k) of Vehicle Code section 11713.13.

#### FRANCHISOR COMPETING WITH A DEALER - Motor Vehicle Dealers

Vehicle Code section 3065.3(d) provides that "[n]o franchisor shall compete with a dealer in violation of subdivision (o) of Section 11713.3."

Subdivision (o) of Vehicle Code section 11713.3 provides that:

It is unlawful and a violation of this code for any manufacturer, manufacturer branch, distributor, or distributor branch licensed under this code to do, directly or indirectly through an affiliate, any of the following:

(o) (1) To compete with their franchisees in the sale, lease, or warranty service of new motor vehicles.

(2) A manufacturer, branch, or distributor, or an entity that controls or is controlled by a manufacturer, branch, or distributor, shall not, however, be deemed to be competing in the following limited circumstances:

(A) Owning or operating a dealership for a temporary period, not to exceed one year at the location of a former dealership of the same line-make that has been out of operation for less than six months. However, after a showing of good cause by a manufacturer, branch, or distributor that it needs additional time to operate a dealership in preparation for sale to a successor independent franchisee, the board may extend the time period.

(B) Owning an interest in a dealer as part of a bona fide dealer development program that satisfies all of the following requirements:

. . .

(4) In addition to the exceptions identified in paragraphs (2) and (3), a manufacturer, manufacturer branch, distributor, or distributor branch, or an affiliate thereof, shall not be deemed to be competing with their franchisees in any of the following limited circumstances:

. . .

#### Time for Filing a Protest

There is no specific statutory time period in the Vehicle Code within which to file a Vehicle Code section 3065.3 protest. Failure to file a protest within a reasonable time, however, could result in a dealer losing the right to a hearing by the Board.

## Required Elements of Protest

The required content of a protest under Vehicle Code section 3065.3 is described in 13 CCR § 586.5. A protest must contain all of the following (see Appendix for sample Form A):

Content Requirements	<b>Regulatory Authority</b>
Must be in writing and be signed by a franchisee or its attorney. <sup>23</sup>	13 CCR § 583
Must set forth in clear and concise language the factual contentions of the franchisee with respect to the protest.	13 CCR § 586.5(a)(1)
Must set forth the franchisee's mailing address and telephone number, and the name, mailing address and telephone number of its attorney or authorized agent, if any. All correspondence and notices to the franchisee shall thereafter be addressed to said address, if the dealer principal is presenting its own case, or to the address of the dealer's attorney or agent, if so represented.	13 CCR § 586.5(a)(3)
Shall indicate either that the franchisee does or does not desire to appear before the Board.	13 CCR § 586.5(a)(4)
Franchisee may submit, as exhibits to the protest, photographic, documentary, or similar physical evidence relevant to the matter with an appropriate description in the protest.	13 CCR § 586.5(a)(2)
Franchisee shall simultaneously deliver a \$200 filing fee in the form of a check or money order payable to the New Motor Vehicle Board, or a request for a fee waiver.	13 CCR § 553.40
Franchisee shall serve a copy of the protest on the franchisor and proof of service shall accompany the protest submitted to the Board.	13 CCR § 584 13 CCR § 551.24

# **Determination of Protest**

If there is a hearing, the franchisor has the burden of proof that it complied with Vehicle Code section 3065.3; i.e., the franchisor is not competing with a dealer in violation of subdivision (o) of Vehicle Code section 11713.3. (Veh. Code § 3065.3(e)).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> See footnote 7.

## HEARING PROCEDURES

#### **Pre-Hearing Procedure**

Upon receiving a protest, the Board shall institute hearing proceedings similar to those of a formal civil trial, including the scheduling of various pre-hearing conferences, settlement conferences, arrangements for discovery, identification of witnesses, and so on. The Board may impose sanctions if a party fails to comply with the Board's discovery orders or fails to participate properly in a settlement conference.

## **Discovery**

Pursuant to Vehicle Code section 3050.1, the Board may authorize the parties to engage in the civil discovery process. Discovery is limited to requests for depositions and demands for production of documents (Code Civ. Proc. § 2016.010, et seq.), with the exception of provisions for written interrogatories (Code Civ. Proc. § 2030.010). Section 551.6 of the Board's regulations implements and makes specific the Board's procedures for requesting depositions where the witness resides within California or outside of California.

The enactment of the Electronic Discovery Act (Assembly Bill 5, Stats. 2009, Ch. 5, "Act"), effective June 29, 2009, broadened the categories of discoverable materials (documents, tangible things, land or other property) by adding "electronically stored information" (ESI).

Effective January 1, 2013, sections of the Civil Discovery Act relating to ESI were amended in order to address several inconsistencies (Senate Bill 1574, Stats. 2012, Ch. 72). ESI is now included among the things under a witnesses control that the witness would be bound by law to produce pursuant to a subpoena. Additionally, when any method of discovery permits, compels, prevents, or limits the production, inspection, copying, testing, or sampling of documents or tangible things, the same method would also apply to ESI. In general, if a demand for production does not specify a form or forms for producing a type of ESI, the responding party would be required to produce the information in the form or forms in which it is ordinarily maintained or in a form that is reasonably usable, but need not produce the same ESI in more than one form.

#### <u>Subpoenas</u>

Authority for issuing subpoenas in Board proceedings is found in Vehicle Code section 3050.1 and 13 CCR § 551.2.

Section 551.2(b) of the Board's regulations specifically incorporates Code of Civil Procedure section 1985, et seq., excepting the provisions of subdivision (c) of section 1985. Section 1985.8 of the Code of Civil Procedure imposes additional requirements on the parties, (or the court, if necessary), to resolve ESI issues as to the form, burdens and expenses of production, shifting or allocation of costs, and issues arising from other characteristics of ESI. The Act requires the parties, or the court, to weigh various cost/benefit factors in light of the amount in controversy in the proceeding to shape and limit the scope and nature of requests to produce ESI.

Unlike the civil courts, the parties cannot issue their own subpoenas. On the request of any party, the Board, its Executive Director or an ALJ may issue subpoenas for the production of papers, records, and books by a witness or a deponent, and the appearance of a non-party witness or deponent. Hearing subpoenas are issued in accordance with 13 CCR § 551.2(b) and an affidavit is not required to support the request. For a hearing subpoena duces tecum, an affidavit must accompany the request.

Subpoenas for the attendance and testimony of a non-party deponent, or for a subpoena duces tecum for deposition of a non-party, are issued by the Board in accordance with Code of Civil Procedure section 2016.010, et seq., excepting the provisions of section 2020.210, subdivisions (a) and (b). (13 CCR § 551.2(c)) No affidavits are required. Counsel for the parties can issue notices of depositions to parties. (Code Civ. Proc. § 2025.010, et seq.) Subpoenas for out-of-state, non-party witnesses or deponents will be issued by the Board but need to be enforced in the out-of-state court. (Code Civ. Proc. § 2026.010, et seq.)

Government Code section 11450.30 and 13 CCR § 551.2(e) permit a person served with a subpoena or a subpoena duces tecum to object to its terms by a motion for a protective order, including a motion to quash. The assigned ALJ would resolve the objection. The ALJ may make another order that is appropriate to protect the parties or the witness from unreasonable or oppressive demands, including violations of the right to privacy.

Following service of the subpoena on the witness or deponent, a copy of the subpoena and executed proof of service shall be filed with the Board. (13 CCR § 551.2(d))

## Summary of Board Action

All hearings on protests filed pursuant to Vehicle Code sections 3060, 3062, 3064, 3065, 3065.1, 3065.3, 3065.4, 3070, 3072, 3074, 3075, or 3076, may be considered by the entire Board<sup>24</sup> or may, at its discretion be conducted by one of the Board's ALJs. At the hearing, oral argument is heard, evidence is admitted, testimony is received, and a written decision is rendered. The procedures are described in detail in Vehicle Code sections 3066 and 3080. The Board on receiving a protest does the following:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Board ALJs generally preside over merits hearings not the Board itself. (See footnote 6 pertaining to OAH and the discussion on page 6 pertaining to dealer member participation in Article 4 protests.) For new protests, the Board adopted a numerical designation system. The ALJ is assigned based on the last digit of the Protest No. If a Board ALJ is unavailable, OAH would preside. For existing protests, ALJs will continue to be assigned at the Hearing Readiness Conference using the Merit Hearings Judge Assignment Log on a rotational basis.

Step	Action		
1	By order fix a time within sixty (60) days of the order and place of hearing. <sup>25</sup>		
2	Send a copy of the order to the franchisor, the protesting franchisee, and all individuals and groups that have requested notification by the Board of protests and decisions by the Board.		
	<ul> <li>Except in the case of a franchisee who deals exclusively in motorcycles, the Board or its Executive Director may accelerate or postpone the date initially established for the hearing.</li> </ul>		
	<ul> <li>For the purpose of accelerating or postponing the hearing date, good cause must be established and in no event may the rescheduled hearing date be more than 90 days after the Board's initial order.</li> </ul>		
	<ul> <li>"Good cause" for accelerating or postponing a hearing includes, but is not limited to, the effects on, and any irreparable harm to, the parties or interested persons or groups if the request for a change in hearing date is not granted.</li> </ul>		
	<ul> <li>Application for continuance shall be in writing and filed with the Executive Director at least 10 days prior to the date of hearing. No continuances otherwise will be granted except in extreme emergencies such as serious accident or death. (13 CCR § 592)</li> </ul>		
3	The Board or an ALJ designated by the Board presides over merits hearings on protests. <sup>26</sup>		

# Stipulation of Fact

A hearing initiated by the filing of a protest may be held in whole or in part on a stipulation of fact, which is essentially an agreement between the parties defining points that are not in contention, and other parts of the dispute that have been resolved. Stipulations are of value in that they tend to facilitate and expedite conflict resolution. (See 13 CCR § 587 for procedural details of stipulation of fact before the Board.)

## Stipulated Decisions

The Board may adopt stipulated decisions and orders without a hearing pursuant to Vehicle Code sections 3066 and 3080 to resolve one or more issues raised by a protestant or petitioner before

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> In practice, the parties stipulate to a date for the merits hearing and the Board issues the order of time and place of hearing approximately 45 days prior to the hearing. If OAH is assigned to preside over the merits hearing, the protest is transferred to OAH after the Hearing Readiness Conference and would go to hearing in about three months.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> See footnote 24.

the Board. If the Board adopts a stipulated decision and order to resolve a protest filed under Vehicle Code section 3060 or 3070, and the parties stipulate that good cause exists to terminate, a hearing requiring a determination of good cause will not be required. (Veh. Code § 3050.7(b))

#### Hearings Open to the Public; Protective Orders

Hearings before the Board or an ALJ designated by the Board are open to the public. For good cause shown, a party may seek an order closing all or part of the hearing or for other protective orders as set forth in Government Code section 11425.20 and 13 CCR § 551.20. The motion may be in writing or made orally on the record. It may be made at the commencement of or during the course of the hearing but must be made as early as is practicable. The motion shall clearly identify the relief sought; the facts, circumstances, and legal authority; and shall include declarations or evidence that support the motion. The ALJ has discretion to allow an oral or written opposition to the motion. When ruling on the motion, the ALJ shall specifically set forth the facts, legal basis, and findings that support any protective order, order to seal parts of the record, or order to close the hearing to the public. The motion, opposition, and any resulting orders then become part of the record.

## Failure to Appear at a Hearing

Any party who fails to appear at a hearing will not be entitled to a further opportunity to be heard unless good cause for such failure is shown to the Board or to the ALJ within five (5) days thereafter. The lack of such a showing may, in the discretion of the Board or the ALJ, be interpreted as an abandonment of interest by the party in the subject matter of the proceeding. (13 CCR § 589)

#### Decision of the Board

When matters are submitted to the Board for decision, or the Board receives a proposed decision of the ALJ, the Board shall take the matter under submission and conduct deliberations in executive session. The deliberations of the Board shall be in private and shall not be reported. (Veh. Code § 3008; 13 CCR § 588)

The decision of the Board shall be in writing, contain findings of fact, and a determination of the issues presented. The Board shall sustain, conditionally sustain, overrule, or conditionally overrule the protest. The decision becomes final when delivered or mailed to the parties and there are no provisions for reconsideration or rehearing. If the Board fails to act within 30 days after the close of the hearing, within 30 days after the Board receives a proposed decision where the case is heard before an ALJ, or within a period which may be mutually agreed on by the parties, then the proposed action of the franchisor shall be deemed to be approved. (Veh. Code §§ 3067 and 3081)

## Court Reporting and Transcripts of Board Proceedings

Under the authority of 13 CCR § 551.7 the Board may assume all or part of the cost of reporting any proceedings or may allocate costs entirely to one of the parties or apportion it among the various parties at its discretion. For all merits hearings and dispositive motions, reporting costs will be allocated as follows:

Circumstances	Reporting Costs including Appearance, Delivery Fees, and any other Costs	Transcript Fees for the Board and Office of Administrative Hearings (if applicable)
Hearings on the merits and dispositive motions <sup>27</sup>	Participating parties	Participating parties
Other motions (venue, consolidation, continuation, etc.)	Requesting party or parties	Requesting party or parties
Pre-hearing conference	Requesting party or parties	Requesting party or parties
Discovery disputes (ruling on objections to production, motions to quash, etc.)	Requesting party or parties	Requesting party or parties

For merits and dispositive motion hearings, the parties, on an equal basis, are responsible for arranging reporting services, paying for the reporter's appearance fee, the delivery fee and any other costs, and the cost of certified hearing transcript(s) for the New Motor Vehicle Board and Office of Administrative Hearings, if applicable. Counsel are responsible for purchasing their own transcript(s), if desired.

In any other instance, where any party or parties deem reporting services necessary (including requests for reporter's appearance and for transcripts), the requesting party (or parties on any basis they agree upon) will be responsible for arranging reporter services and will be responsible for payment to the reporting service of the reporter's appearance fee, the delivery fee, and any other costs. The requesting party or parties will also be responsible for providing the Board and Office of Administrative Hearings, if applicable, with a certified copy of the transcript. Counsel are responsible for purchasing their own transcript(s), if desired.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> "Dispositive motions" are those that result in a final determination of the protest or petition before the Board.

## PETITIONS

## **Statutory Authority for Petitions**

Vehicle Code section 3050(b) provides for any person to petition the Board to "[c]onsider any matter concerning the activities or practices of any person applying for or holding a license as a new motor vehicle dealer, manufacturer, manufacturer branch, distributor, distributor branch, or representative pursuant to Chapter 4 (commencing with Section 11700) of Division 5 submitted by any person...."

Subdivision (b)(2)(B) of Section 3050, in which the relief sought is adjudication, only pertains to petitions filed with the Board by any member of the public, including a consumer, or other person that is not applying for or holding a license as a new motor vehicle dealer, manufacturer, manufacturer branch, distributor, distributor branch or representative pursuant to Chapter 4 (commencing with Section 11700) of Division 5. It is intended that, for the Board to have jurisdiction over a petition pursuant to this subdivision, the petitioner must have filed the petition or consent to the jurisdiction by the Board. This subdivision does not affect petitions filed by licensees nor does it affect respondents (see Vehicle Code section 3051 identifying the licensees within the Board's jurisdiction).

#### Filing a Petition with the Board

A licensee or member of the public wishing to bring a dispute before the Board pursuant to Vehicle Code section 3050(b) is required to file a petition (see Appendix for sample Forms B1 and B2). The petition shall clearly identify the facts, legal authority, and relief sought and include declarations or other evidence or documents that support the petition. (13 CCR § 556)

In the past, petitions filed with the Board have alleged such things as the unreasonable refusal of a franchisor to approve a change in ownership, unreasonable refusal of a franchisor to approve a relocation, discrimination in allocation of products, failure to supply products authorized to be sold under the terms of the franchise, and other violations of the Vehicle Code. Such petitions requested a hearing before the Board and sought relief in the form of a Board order that required the respondent to either do, undo, or refrain from doing some action that caused harm to the licensee petitioner.

However, as a result of *Mazda Motor of America, Inc.* v. *California New Motor Vehicle Board; David J. Phillips Buick-Pontiac, Inc., Real Party in Interest* (2003) 110 Cal.App.4<sup>th</sup> 1451, the Board's jurisdiction to hold hearings and issue such orders is now limited to petitioners who are members of the public under Vehicle Code section 3050(b)(2)(A). In all instances where licensees are the petitioners, the Board may only direct the Department to investigate or take licensing action against the respondent under Vehicle Code section 3050(b)(1) and (3).

In all circumstances, the petition shall be served on the respondent and proof of service filed with the Board.

## Time for Filing a Petition

There are no specific statutory time limits in the Vehicle Code within which a petition must be filed, but failure to file the petition within a reasonable time after the occurrence of events giving rise to the basis for the petition could result in the Board refusing to take any action. The respondent shall file a written answer within 30 days of the date the petition is served on the respondent. By declaration, the respondent may submit, as exhibits to the answer, photographic, documentary or similar physical evidence relevant to the matter in support of the answer with an appropriate description thereof in the answer sufficient to identify them and to explain their relevancy. (13 CCR § 558).

## **Petition Filing Fee**

A filing fee of \$200, which should be in the form of a check or money order payable to the New Motor Vehicle Board, must accompany the petition and answer. Either the petitioner or respondent may submit a request for a fee waiver. The Executive Director, upon a showing of good cause, may waive the \$200 filing fee (13 CCR § 553.40). (Samples are available on the Board's website.)

# **Required Elements of Petition**

The required content of a petition under Vehicle Code section 3050(b) is described in 13 CCR § 555 (see Appendix for sample Forms B1 and B2).

Content Requirements	<b>Regulatory Authority</b>
Must set forth in clear and concise language the nature of the	13 CCR § 555
matter, which the petitioner wishes the Board to consider.	
Must contain the petitioner's name, mailing address and	13 CCR § 555(a)
telephone number; the name, mailing address and telephone	
number of the petitioner's attorney or authorized agent, if any;	
and the name and address of the licensee or applicant for	
license (respondent) whose activities or practices are in	
question. All correspondence and notices to the petitioner shall	
thereafter be addressed to petitioner's address, if the petitioner	
appears in person, or to the address of the petitioner's attorney	
or agent, if so represented.	
Must include the names, residence addresses and business	13 CCR § 555(b)
addresses of persons and the dates, places and specific	
actions or practices involved.	
Shall include a concise recitation of applicable law and citation	13 CCR § 555(c)
to the applicable statutes and authorities if the actions or	
practices described in the petition are alleged to be a violation	
of law.	
For petitioners who are members of the public only, petitioner	13 CCR § 555(d)
shall state if the petitioner desires that the Board mediate,	
arbitrate, or resolve a difference between the petitioner and	
respondent, and describe the relief sought.	
Petitioner may submit, as exhibits to the petition, photographic,	13 CCR § 555(e)
documentary, or similar physical evidence relevant to the	
matter with an appropriate description in the petition.	
For petitioners who are members of the public only, petitioner	13 CCR § 555(f)
shall set forth an estimate of the number of days required to	
complete the hearing.	
For petitioners who are members of the public only, petitioner	13 CCR § 555(g)
shall request a pre-hearing conference if one is desired.	
Petitioner shall simultaneously deliver a \$200 filing fee in the	13 CCR § 553.40
form of a check or money order payable to the New Motor	
Vehicle Board, or a request for a fee waiver.	
Petitioner shall serve a copy of the petition on the respondent	13 CCR § 555.1
and proof of service shall accompany the petition submitted to	13 CCR § 551.24
the Board.	

## First Consideration

If the petitioner is a member of the public seeking relief under Vehicle Code section 3050(b)(2)(A), upon the filing of a petition with the Board, a copy shall be forwarded by the Executive Director of the Board to each Board member for consideration. Within 10 days of receipt of a copy of the petition, unless any member of the Board notifies the Executive Director of an objection, the Executive Director shall set the matter for a hearing.

## **Resolution of Petitions without a Hearing**

If the petitioner is a licensee or member of the public seeking relief under Vehicle Code section 3050(b)(1) and/or (3), these petitions would not be submitted to the Board for first consideration, as the authority for first consideration (13 CCR § 557), limits first consideration to matters in which a hearing is sought, i.e., Vehicle Code section 3050(b)(2)(A) petitions. These petitions would be agendized for consideration of the relief requested by the petitioner at the next regularly scheduled meeting. Such petitions are not assigned to an ALJ and are not subject to the normal evidentiary hearing process. The Board members, at a noticed meeting, would hear from the parties by way of written and oral arguments, and consider granting the relief requested. After consideration, the public members of the Board shall take final action and issue a written order that either grants the appropriate relief pursuant to Vehicle Code section 3050(b)(1) or (b)(3), or orders the petition dismissed (13 CCR § 562(b), (d), and (e)). The public members of the Board may also request further briefing and/or the submission of further evidence and continue the matter to a later open meeting for consideration and final action.

## **Challenge to Presiding Officer**

A party may request disqualification of a Board member or an ALJ for cause prior to the taking of evidence by filing an affidavit stating the grounds for the request (13 CCR § 551.1). Further, 13 CCR § 551.12(b) entitles a party, excluding an intervenor, in a petition to one disqualification without cause (peremptory challenge) of the assigned merits ALJ by filing the peremptory challenge with the Board no later than either 20 days from the date of the order of time and place of hearing identifying the merits ALJ or 20 days prior to the date scheduled for commencement of the merits hearing, whichever is earlier (13 CCR § 551.12(b)(1)). In the event a Board ALJ is unavailable to preside over the merits hearing, an ALJ from the Office of Administrative Hearings will be assigned. A peremptory challenge of the assigned administrative law judge is not authorized for law and motion hearings, settlement conferences, and rulings on discovery disputes. Except for the convenience of the Board or for good cause shown, no merits hearing shall be continued by the filing of a peremptory challenge.

#### Motion for Intervention

Any person, including a Board member, concerned with the activities or practices of any person applying for or holding a license as a new motor vehicle dealer, manufacturer, manufacturer branch, distributor, distributor branch or representative may file a motion to intervene in a pending petition subject to the conditions set forth in 13 CCR § 551.13.

## Amicus Curiae Briefs

The Board, its Executive Director, or an ALJ may, in their discretion, allow the filing of amicus curiae briefs. (13 CCR § 551.13)

## Summary of Board Action

For petitions seeking relief under Vehicle Code section 3050(b)(1) and/or (3) brought by a franchisee, including RV franchisees, a member of the Board who is a new motor vehicle dealer may not participate in, hear, comment, advise other members upon, or decide any petition. (Veh. Code § 3050(b)) For petitions brought by members of the public seeking Vehicle Code section 3050(b)(1) and/or (3) relief, all members of the Board may participate.

After considering this type of petition, the Board may do any one or any combination of the following:

- (1) Direct the Department to conduct an investigation and submit a written report;
- (2) Order the Department to exercise any and all authority or power that the Department may have with respect to the issuance, renewal, refusal to renew, suspension, or revocation of the license of respondent; and/or
- (3) Order the petition dismissed, with or without prejudice.

As stated above, if the petitioner is a member of the public seeking relief under Vehicle Code section 3050(b)(2), the Board retains the authority to hear and/or mediate the matter.

#### Hearing Procedures

The Board's powers in relation to petitions are discretionary, and there is no automatic right to a hearing for a member of the public seeking relief under Vehicle Code section 3050(b)(2)(A). If the Board orders a hearing, the pre-hearing procedures are similar to those involving protests. For procedural details for hearings on petitions, see 13 CCR § 580.

#### Informal Mediation

Prior to a member of the public initiating a petition seeking relief under Vehicle Code section 3050(b)(2)(A), a party or parties may request the Board informally mediate the potential dispute, that is, the activities or practices of a licensee or applicant for a license that are in question (13 CCR §§ 551.14-551.17). If both parties consent to informal mediation, then a mutually agreeable date for the mediation is calendared. Each party files and serves a pre-mediation statement setting forth the facts, issues, and proposed resolution of the matter. The Board, its Executive Director, or an ALJ designated by the Board or its Executive Director preside over the informal mediation and may authorize discovery (other than interrogatories) as appropriate. Evidence in the form of declarations may also be considered. All communications, negotiations, and settlement discussions between the participants of an informal mediation are confidential. At any time during this process, either party may request that the informal mediation be converted to a formal petition.

#### Members of the Public in Relation to New Recreational Vehicle Transactions

Members of the public have all the rights and remedies available in disputes with licensees in new recreational vehicle transactions as they do in transactions with other types of new motor vehicles under the jurisdiction of the Board with one distinction. Vehicle Code section 3078(a) states:

If the board receives a complaint from a member of the public seeking a refund involving the sale or lease of, or a replacement of, a recreational vehicle, as defined in subdivision (a) of Section 18010 of the Health and Safety Code, from a recreational vehicle dealership, as defined in subdivision (d) of Section 3072, the board shall recommend that the complainant consult with the Department of Consumer Affairs.

Thus, if a member of the public specifically seeks a refund or a replacement of a new recreational vehicle, the Board shall recommend that the complaint be referred to the Department of Consumer affairs, rather than the Board. However, nothing precludes a member of the public from seeking help from the Board in resolving the dispute as is available for any other new motor vehicle purchaser.

#### JUDICIAL REVIEW

#### **Appeal to Superior Court**

Judicial review of final orders and decisions of the Board may be sought in Superior Court pursuant to Code of Civil Procedure section 1094.5 via a petition for writ of administrative mandamus. A petition for writ of administrative mandamus questions whether the Board proceeded without or in excess of jurisdiction, whether there was a fair hearing, and whether there was any prejudicial abuse of the Board's discretion. Parties seeking judicial review of a final order or decision should refer to Vehicle Code sections 3068 and 3082 and local rules of court.

# **APPENDIX**

Form A - Protest Form B1 - Petition (Veh. Code § 3050(b)(2)(A)) Form B2 - Petition (Veh. Code § 3050(b)(1) or (b)3))

#### SAMPLE FORM A -

#### PLEADING FORMAT OF PROTEST

The information contained in this sample form is intended to be informative and not advisory, limited in scope, and not intended to be a substitute for a careful reading of the specific statutes and/or regulations which may apply to your situation. For information on the format of filings and notices with the New Motor Vehicle Board, see 13 CCR § 593.1, et seq. **Sample forms can be obtained from the Board's website**, www.nmvb.ca.gov.

#### **Identification of Attorney or Party Representing Self:**

In the top left-hand corner beginning with line one, place the name of the attorney (include state bar number) or individual representing itself, office address or residence address, telephone number, and email address, if available. Single space this section. Skip one line then add which party is filing this document. In the case of a protest, the individual filing the protest is known as the "Protestant," whereas the individual responding would be the "Respondent."

1\_\_\_\_\_\_[name of attorney and state bar number, or name of party representing itself]2\_\_\_\_\_\_[address]3\_\_\_\_\_\_[telephone number, fax number and email address, if available]4Attorney for [Protestant] or in pro per [if party representing itself]

Leave the upper right-hand corner blank between lines 1 and 7 for the use of the Board.

#### **Title of the Court:**

On lines 8-9, place the title of the agency and the state in which the action is brought. 8 NEW MOTOR VEHICLE BOARD 9 STATE OF CALIFORNIA

#### **Title of the Case:**

Below the title of the court, flushed left, place the title of the case in the caption. The title of the case consists of the names of all of the parties.

#### Case Number:

The number of the case should be placed to the right of the title of the case or caption. Parties may leave the actual number blank until the Board has assigned the case a number.

#### Nature of Filing and Name of Action:

Below the number of the case, place the type of action filed along with the particular code section pursuant to which the action is filed.

#### Footer:

Except for exhibits, each paper filed with the Board must bear a footer in the bottom margin of each page, placed below the page number and divided from the rest of the document page by a printed line. The footer must contain the title of the paper or some clear and concise abbreviation in at least 10-point font.

11	In the Matter of the Protest of	)
12	NAME OF FRANCHISEE,	) Protest No. PR-
13	Protestant,	) PROTEST
14	v.	<ul> <li>(Vehicle Code section 3060, 3062,</li> <li>3064, 3065, 3065.1, 3065.3, 3065.4, 307</li> </ul>
15	NAME OF FRANCHISOR,	) 3072, 3074, 3075, and 3076] ) [Dates of the hearing and any future
16	Respondent.	<ul> <li>pre-hearing or settlement</li> <li>conferences, if known]</li> </ul>

## Introduction:

State the name of the party filing the document, the type of document filed (e.g., protest, response, motion) and the applicable statutory authority.

- 20 Protestant, [NAME OF PARTY/DEALERSHIP NAME], files this protest under the
- 21 provisions of the California Vehicle Code section [applicable code section] with
- 22 reference to the following facts:

## **Body:**

Using numbered paragraphs, state the allegations in a clear and chronological order.

1. Protestant is a new motor vehicle dealer selling [type of new motor vehicle or recreational vehicle] and is located at [address]. Protestant's telephone number is [telephone number].

2. Respondent distributes/manufacturers [type/model of product] and is the franchisor of Protestant.

3. Protestant is represented in this matter by [attorney/law firm], whose address and telephone number are [address and telephone number].

4. On or about [date of occurrence(s)], Protestant received from Respondent a notice that Respondent intends to [terminate/modify/relocate/establish] its existing franchise agreement effective [number of days] from Protestant's receipt of said notice. A copy of said letter is attached as Exhibit A.

5. Protestant generally denies each and every allegation contained in the written notice of [termination/modification/relocation/establishment].

6. Respondent does not have good cause to [terminate/modify/relocate/establish] the franchise by reason of the following facts:

(a) [Specific facts upon which Protestant bases the allegations].

7. Protestant and its attorneys of record desire to appear before the Board. The estimated length of hearing on this matter will take [number of days] to complete.

8. A Pre-Hearing Conference is requested.

Dated:

Signed:

# SAMPLE FORM B1 - PLEADING FORMAT OF PETITION (Veh. Code § 3050(b)(2)(A))

The information contained in this sample form is intended to be informative and not advisory, limited in scope, and not intended to be a substitute for a careful reading of the specific statutes and/or regulations which may apply to your situation. For information on the format of filings and notices with the New Motor Vehicle Board, see 13 CCR § 593.1, et seq. **Sample forms can be obtained from the Board's website**, www.nmvb.ca.gov.

## Identification of Attorney or Party Representing Self:

In the top left-hand corner beginning with line one, place the name of the attorney (include state bar number) or individual representing self, office address or residence address, telephone number, and email address, if available. Single space this section. Skip one line then add which party is filing this document. In the case of a petition, the individual filing the petition is known as the "Petitioner," and the party responding would be the "Respondent."

- 1\_\_\_\_\_ [name of attorney and state bar number, or name of party representing itself] 2 [address]
- 3 [telephone number, fax number and email address, if available]
  - Attorney for [Petitioner] or in proper [if party representing itself]

Leave the upper right-hand corner blank between lines 1 and 7 for the use of the Board.

#### **Title of the Court:**

4

On lines 8-9, place the title of the agency and the state in which the action is brought. 8 NEW MOTOR VEHICLE BOARD 9 STATE OF CALIFORNIA

#### **<u>Title of the Case:</u>**

Below the title of the court, flushed left, place the title of the case in the caption. The title of the case consists of the names of all of the parties.

#### Case Number:

The number of the case should be placed to the right of the title of the case or caption. Parties may leave the actual number blank until the Board has assigned the case a number.

#### Nature of Filing and Name of Action:

Below the number of the case, place the type of action filed along with the particular code section pursuant to which the action is filed.

#### Footer:

Except for exhibits, each paper filed with the Board must bear a footer in the bottom margin of each page, placed below the page number and divided from the rest of the document page by a printed line. The footer must contain the title of the paper or some clear and concise abbreviation in at least 10-point font.

11	In the Matter of the Petition of	)	
12	NAME OF INDIVIDUAL,	) Petition No. P-	
13	Petitioner	)	
14	v.	<ul> <li>) <b>PETITION</b></li> <li>) [Vehicle Code section 3050(b)</li> </ul>	(2)(A)
15	NAME OF LICENSEE,	)	)(2)(1)]
16	Responde	<ul> <li>) [Dates of the hearing and any pre-hearing or settlement</li> <li>) conferences, if known]</li> </ul>	future

20 [NAME OF INDIVIDUAL], petitions the New Motor Vehicle Board, pursuant to Vehicle Code section 3050(b)(2)(A), with reference to the following facts:

1. Petitioner is, and at all times mentioned herein, an individual and consumer of a new motor vehicle or vehicles in the State of California.

2. Respondent is, and at all times mentioned herein, a licensee authorized to do business and doing business in the State of California.

3. Petitioner is represented in this matter by (name, address, and telephone number of law firm, or representative).

4. Petitioner's mailing address and telephone number are as follows:

5. Respondent's mailing address and telephone number are as follows:

6. (Outline the particulars of the dispute).

7. WHEREFORE, Petitioner prays as follows: (A hearing and relief available under Vehicle Code section 3050(b)(2)(A)).

Dated:

Signed:

Petition (Veh. Code § 3050(b)(2)(A))

## SAMPLE FORM B2 - PLEADING FORMAT OF PETITION (Veh. Code § 3050(b)(1) or (3))

The information contained in this sample form is intended to be informative and not advisory, limited in scope, and not intended to be a substitute for a careful reading of the specific statutes and/or regulations which may apply to your situation. For information on the format of filings and notices with the New Motor Vehicle Board, see 13 CCR § 593.1, et seq. **Sample forms can be obtained from the Board's website**, www.nmvb.ca.gov.

## Identification of Attorney or Party Representing Self:

In the top left-hand corner beginning with line one, place the name of the attorney (include state bar number) or individual representing itself, office address or residence address, telephone number, and email address, if available. Single space this section. Skip one line then add which party is filing this document. In the case of a petition, the individual filing the petition is known as the "Petitioner," and the party responding would be the "Respondent."

- 1\_\_\_\_\_\_
   [name of attorney and state bar number, or name of party representing itself]

   2\_\_\_\_\_\_
   [address]
- 3\_\_\_\_\_ [telephone number, fax number and email address, if available]

Attorney for [Petitioner] or in pro per [if party representing itself]

Leave the upper right-hand corner blank between lines 1 and 7 for the use of the Board.

## **Title of the Court:**

4

On lines 8-9, place the title of the agency and the state in which the action is brought. 8 NEW MOTOR VEHICLE BOARD 9 STATE OF CALIFORNIA

#### **<u>Title of the Case:</u>**

Below the title of the court, flushed left, place the title of the case in the caption. The title of the case consists of the names of all of the parties.

#### Case Number:

The number of the case should be placed to the right of the title of the case or caption. Parties may leave the actual number blank until the Board has assigned the case a number.

#### Nature of Filing and Name of Action:

Below the number of the case, place the type of action filed along with the particular code section pursuant to which the action is filed.

#### Footer:

Except for exhibits, each paper filed with the Board must bear a footer in the bottom margin of each page, placed below the page number and divided from the rest of the document page by a printed line. The footer must contain the title of the paper or some clear and concise abbreviation in at least 10-point font.

11	In the Matter of the Petition of	)
12	NAME OF INDIVIDUAL/LICENSEE	E, ) Petition
13	Petitione	) er, )
14	V.	) ) <b>PETIT</b> ]
15	NAME OF LICENSEE,	) [Vehicle ) [Vehicle
16	Respond	) ent. )
		)

No. P-

ON

Code section 3050(b)(1)] Code section 3050(b)(3)]

19 [NAME OF INDIVIDUAL/LICENSEE], petitions the New Motor Vehicle Board, pursuant to Vehicle Code section 3050(b), with reference to the following facts:

1. Petitioner is, and at all times mentioned herein, a licensee of the Department of Motor Vehicles authorized to do business and doing business in the State of California or is an individual and consumer of a new motor vehicle or vehicles in the State of California.

2. Respondent is, and at all times mentioned herein, a licensee of the Department of Motor Vehicles authorized to do business and doing business in the State of California.

3. Petitioner is represented in this matter by (name, address, and telephone number of law firm).

- 4. Petitioner's mailing address and telephone number are as follows:
- 5. Respondent's mailing address and telephone number are as follows:
- 6. (Outline the particulars of the dispute).

7. WHEREFORE, Petitioner prays as follows: (That the Board provides relief available under Vehicle Code section 3050(b)(1) and/or 3050(b)(3).)

Dated:

Signed:

Petition (Veh. Code § 3050(b)(1) or (3))